Supporting Information for

**Economic status and acknowledgement of earned entitlement**

Abigail Barr, Justine Burns, Luis Miller*, Ingrid Shaw

*To whom correspondence should be addressed. E-mail: luismiguel.miller@ehu.es

This PDF file includes:

- Experimental procedures
- Experimental participants
- Performance in the real effort task and initial endowments in the 4PDG under the earned treatment
- Further Analysis of South African student sample
- Adding control variables to Model 2
- Further exploratory analysis of the Oxford data and the two datasets pooled
- UK protocol
- UK scripts
- UK post-experimental questionnaire
- Session form
- SA protocol
- SA scripts
- SA post-experimental questionnaire
Experimental procedures

The specific design and presentation of both the 4PDG and the real effort task reflected our intention to involve people from all walks of life in the experiment. Both were manual, highly visual, and required neither literacy nor much in the way of numeracy or analytical ability.

The real effort task involved sorting yellow and blue gravel into various containers for seven minutes. There were two versions of the task. In one (referred to below as the “filling task”), participants were given a box of mixed yellow and blue gravel and a tray full of small plastic pots (see Photo 1 below). They had to put seven pieces of blue gravel and seven pieces of yellow gravel in each small pot. In the other (referred to below as the “emptying task”), participants received a tray full of small plastic pots each containing a mixture of blue and yellow gravel and two larger containers and were asked to empty the small pots and sort the gravel by colour, putting the blue gravel in one of the larger containers and the yellow gravel in the other (see Photo 2 below). Note that the filling task can be viewed as preparation for the emptying task and vice-versa. This enabled us to tell the participants in each session that they were helping us sort out some materials that would be used in subsequent sessions. Thus, we encouraged the participants to view their efforts as genuinely productive.

In the earned treatment, the number of small pots either filled or emptied and their contents sorted determined a participant’s performance rank and, hence, his or her initial endowment in the 4PDG. We chose to use rank instead of absolute numbers of pots to determine initial endowments in the 4PDG for four reasons. First, we conjectured that participant types might vary with respect to either their ability or their willingness to exert effort in the gravel sorting task. In this case, had we used absolute numbers of pots
to determine initial endowments, those initial endowments would have varied systematically across types and we would have been unable to distinguish between type and initial endowment effects. Second, participants’ willingness to exert effort in the gravel sorting task might vary depending on whether they were assigned to the earned or random treatment. In this case, had we used absolute numbers of pots to determine initial endowments, those initial endowments would have varied systematically across the two treatments and we would have been unable to distinguish between treatment and initial endowment effects. Third, had we used absolute numbers of pots to determine initial endowments we would have had to wait until the gravel sorting task was finished before setting up for the 4PDG. Relying on rank allowed us to have the 4PDG already set up, thereby saving time. Finally, we were keen to have the two real effort tasks, pot filling and pot emptying, each one setting up for the other. However, we expected that pot filling would take longer than pot emptying and did not want initial endowments to depend on the task. (An analysis of performance in the real effort task and the relationship between that performance and initial endowments in the 4PDG under the earned treatment is presented in the next section of this document.)

The 4PDG was undertaken using specially designed and manufactured trays (see Photo 3 below). Each participant received a tray. Each tray was divided into four quadrants, each quadrant relating to a participant. The tray-receiving participant’s own quadrant was blue and located at the side of the tray closest to the participant when the tray was placed on a desk in front of him or her. Each quadrant contained a number of counters indicating the initial endowment of the corresponding participant. Each counter was worth £1 (1.64USD at the time of the experiments) in Oxford and 7 Rand (1.??USD at the time of the experiments) in Cape Town. The participants were invited to rearrange
the counters across the quadrants as they saw fit, while being instructed not to remove any of the counters from the tray.

In addition to their payoffs from the 4PDG, each participant received £4 (28 Rand in Cape Town). In the random treatment, this £4 (28 Rand) was presented as a flat fee for the real effort task. In the earned treatment, the £4 (28 Rand) was added to each of the possible earnings levels and then set aside to be collected at the end of the session. Thus, the £4 (28 Rand) represented a minimum total final payoff for each experimental participant. There was no additional show-up fee.

**Experimental participants**

In Oxford the student participants were recruited from Oxford University, Brookes University, and the local college of further education (FE) via e-mail lists. The employed participants were recruited by placing advertisements in various on-line and printed local news-sheets. This approach also attracted a small number of the unemployed participants. However, to reach our sample quota for the unemployed we eventually had to recruit individuals on the day of each experimental session by leafleting directly outside the government office to which they have to report each fortnight in order to receive their cash transfers. Luckily, in Oxford, this office is situated a mere 100 metres from the Nuffield Centre for Experimental Social Sciences. However, this notwithstanding, recruiting the unemployed in sufficient numbers to ensure that sessions could go ahead as planned was a significant challenge.

Our initial objective was to conduct 14 sessions, 6 with students, 4 with unemployed, and 4 with employed, 7 earned and 7 random, each involving 16 participants. This would have yielded a participant sample of 96 students, 64 unemployed, and 64
employed. However, owing to the difficulties of both recruiting unemployed people and then getting them to show up, we ended up running some smaller sessions, one more session than planned (to bring us nearer to our sample quotas), and increasingly mixed sessions (primarily made up of employed and unemployed participants) to ensure that sufficient recruits turned up to make the sessions viable. Had there been large, systematic differences in productivity across participant types, this could have led to systematic differences in rankings and hence initial endowments across participant types in the 4PDG under the earned treatment. The analysis below indicates that there were differences in productivity, but they were minor and, combined with the mixing of types within sessions, were insufficient to generate systematic differences in ranks (within groups of 4) and initial endowments across participant types.

One under-18 year old and several retired people participated and had to be dropped from the sample prior to analysis. Thus, we ended up with an analysable sample containing 204 participants; 80 students (61 in universities, 19 in FE), 62 unemployed, and 62 employed.

**Performance in the real effort task and initial endowments in the 4PDG under the earned treatment**

Tables A1 and A2 present summary statistics on performance in the real effort tasks and initial endowments in the 4PDG. Table A1 focuses on the Oxford sample. Standard t-tests comparing pairs of participant types within tasks and treatments reveal that: the employed emptied significantly fewer pots than the unemployed and students under the random treatment (0.01 and 0.05 two-tailed significance levels respectively); the unemployed filled significantly fewer pots than students under the random treatment (0.05 two-tailed significance level); and students filled significantly more pots than the
employed and unemployed under the earned treatment (0.01 and 0.10 two-tailed significance levels respectively).

Variation in pots processed is important as it determines individual participants’ locations in the initial endowment distributions in the earned treatment. The standard deviations reported in Table A1 reveal that there was considerable variation and only marginal differences in the extent of variation across participant types. Only after pooling across treatments do we find significant differences in the standard deviation of pots processed across participant types. The standard deviation in the filling task is larger for the unemployed compared to students and the employed (0.01 and 0.10 two-tailed significance levels respectively) and in the emptying task is larger for students compared to the employed and the unemployed (0.10 and 0.01 two-tailed significance levels respectively).

Table A1
Summary statistics for performance in the real effort task and own initial endowments in the 4PDG in Oxford

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participant sample</th>
<th>All</th>
<th>Student</th>
<th>Employed</th>
<th>Unemployed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Random treatment</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pot filling</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pots filled</td>
<td>16.77 (4.93)</td>
<td>17.71 (4.29)</td>
<td>17.00* (0.00)</td>
<td>14.10 (6.06)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Own Initial endowment (yi)</td>
<td>0.25 (0.12)</td>
<td>0.25 (0.12)</td>
<td>0.32* (0.12)</td>
<td>0.25 (0.15)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pot emptying</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pots emptied</td>
<td>31.68 (10.09)</td>
<td>36.88 (6.33)</td>
<td>27.46 (10.61)</td>
<td>35.26 (8.43)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Own Initial endowment (yi)</td>
<td>0.25 (0.11)</td>
<td>0.24 (0.12)</td>
<td>0.26 (0.12)</td>
<td>0.24 (0.11)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Earned treatment</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pot filling</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pots filled</td>
<td>17.68 (5.76)</td>
<td>19.96 (3.59)</td>
<td>15.78 (4.92)</td>
<td>17.07 (7.24)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Own Initial endowment (yi)</td>
<td>0.25 (0.11)</td>
<td>0.27 (0.12)</td>
<td>0.23 (0.10)</td>
<td>0.25 (0.12)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table A1 also indicates that using a participant’s performance rank to determine his or her initial endowment in the 4PDG under the earned treatment effectively balanced earned endowments across participant types. There are no significant differences in own initial endowments and no significant differences in standard deviations of initial endowments across participant types either within task-treatment cells or after pooling across treatments and/or tasks.

Table A2 focuses on the Cape Town sample. Standard t-tests comparing pairs of participant types within tasks and treatments reveal only that students filled significantly more pots than the employed and unemployed under the earned treatment (0.01 and 0.10 significance levels respectively).

Table A2
Summary statistics for performance in the real effort task and own initial endowments in the 4PDG in Cape Town

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participant sample</th>
<th>Random treatment</th>
<th>Earned treatment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pot filling</td>
<td>Pot emptying</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pots filled</td>
<td>Pots emptied</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Own Initial endowment (yi)</td>
<td>Own Initial endowment (yi)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All</td>
<td>19.93 (3.62)</td>
<td>36.97 (6.82)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student</td>
<td>19.76 (3.49)</td>
<td>38.07 (6.77)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employed</td>
<td>18.33 (4.93)</td>
<td>37.93 (7.06)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unemployed</td>
<td>20.88 (3.68)</td>
<td>34.95 (6.38)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rich</td>
<td>19.73 (3.17)</td>
<td>36.50 (5.76)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poor</td>
<td>20.15 (4.20)</td>
<td>37.34 (7.62)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.25 (0.12)</td>
<td>0.25 (0.11)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.25 (0.11)</td>
<td>0.25 (0.12)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.25 (0.16)</td>
<td>0.25 (0.12)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.25 (0.12)</td>
<td>0.25 (0.12)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.25 (0.11)</td>
<td>0.25 (0.11)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.25 (0.14)</td>
<td>0.25 (0.12)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Notes: standard deviations in parentheses; # - sample of one.
Table A2 also reveals that, as in Oxford, in Cape Town there was considerable variation and only marginal differences in the extent of variation across participant types. Only after pooling across treatments do we find that the standard deviation in pots processed in the filling task is larger for the unemployed compared to the employed (0.05 two-tailed significance level).

Table A2 also indicates that, as in Oxford, in Cape Town using a participant’s performance rank to determine his or her initial endowment in the 4PDG under the earned treatment effectively balanced earned endowments across participant types. There are no significant differences in own initial endowments and no significant differences in standard deviations of initial endowments across participant types either within task-treatment cells or after pooling across treatments and/or tasks.

Tables A1 and A2 indicate that there were some differences in performance in the real effort task across participant types, but that our protocol was successful in neutralising the effect of these differences on initial endowments in the 4PDG under the real effort task. As an additional check on this important aspect of experimental design, in Tables A3 and A4 parts i and ii, we present a series of simple linear regressions. Table A3 focuses on the Oxford sample. Tables A4.i and A4.ii focus on the Cape Town sample, the former exploring differences across students, the employed and the unemployed and the latter exploring differences between relatively well off and relatively poor participants.
Table A3
Regression analysis of pots processed, initial endowments received, and ranks (within 4) achieved, Oxford data

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sample</th>
<th>All participants</th>
<th>Earned treatment Oxford</th>
<th>Random treatment Oxford</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Dependent variable=pots processed</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coef</td>
<td>se</td>
<td>Coef</td>
<td>se</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constant</td>
<td>38.029</td>
<td>1.173</td>
<td>***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Earned</td>
<td>6.520</td>
<td>1.094</td>
<td>***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unemployed</td>
<td>-3.609</td>
<td>1.249</td>
<td>***</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| **Dependent variable=initial endowment received** | | | |
| Coef | se | Coef | se | Coef | se |
| Constant | 0.257 | 0.019 | *** | 0.261 | 0.024 | *** | 0.237 | 0.032 | *** |
| Earned | -0.001 | 0.017 | | | | | | |
| Filling | 0.000 | 0.018 | | 0.005 | 0.025 | | 0.013 | 0.033 |   |
| Unemployed | -0.015 | 0.020 | | -0.023 | 0.028 | | -0.001 | 0.033 |   |
| Employed | -0.008 | 0.021 | | -0.028 | 0.026 | | 0.027 | 0.039 |   |

| **Dependent variable=rank (within 4) achieved** | | | |
| Coef | se | Coef | se | Coef | se |
| Constant | 2.445 | 0.180 | *** | 2.391 | 0.233 | *** | 2.754 | 0.303 | *** |
| Earned | 0.033 | 0.168 | | | | | | |
| Filling | -0.019 | 0.177 | | -0.066 | 0.249 | | -0.237 | 0.305 |   |
| Unemployed | 0.178 | 0.192 | | 0.276 | 0.271 | | -0.017 | 0.311 |   |
| Employed | 0.043 | 0.200 | | 0.339 | 0.258 | | -0.485 | 0.366 |   |

Notes: Coefficients and corresponding standard errors from linear regressions presented; in the case of rank (within 4) ordered probits yield similar results; *** significant at the 1% level; ** significant at the 5% level; * significant at the 10% level; 

The regressions in the first column of each table are supported by the full sample from the focus location. In this column, each of the three dependent variables, pots processed, initial endowment received, and rank within group of four, is regressed on a dummy variable indicating the earned (as opposed to the random) treatment, a dummy variable indicating the pot filling (as opposed to emptying) real effort task, and one or two dummies identifying the type of participant. The regressions in the second and third columns of each table are supported by the sample assigned to the earned and random
treatments respectively in the focus location. The regressions in these columns have the same model structure as the regressions in the first column except that the dummy variable indicating the earned treatment is omitted.

### Table A4.i
Regression analysis of pots processed, initial endowments received, and ranks (within 4) achieved, Cape Town data, comparison of students, employed and unemployed

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sample</th>
<th>All participants Cape Town</th>
<th>Earned treatment Cape Town</th>
<th>Random treatment Cape Town</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Dependent variable=pots processed</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>constant</td>
<td>38.162</td>
<td>20.088</td>
<td>37.389</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>earned</td>
<td>-0.895</td>
<td>-17.027</td>
<td>-17.439</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>filling</td>
<td>-17.439</td>
<td>-17.027</td>
<td>-17.439</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unemployed</td>
<td>-2.450</td>
<td>-2.853</td>
<td>-1.623</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>employed</td>
<td>-0.879</td>
<td>-1.445</td>
<td>0.280</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| **Dependent variable=initial endowment received** |                   |                             |                             |
| constant                | 0.252                      | 0.251                       | 0.252                       |
| earned                  | 0.001                      | 0.005                       | 0.007                       |
| filling                 | -0.001                     | -0.005                      | -0.011                      |
| unemployed              | 0.001                      | -0.005                      | 0.007                       |
| employed                | -0.005                     | -0.000                      | 0.018                       |

| **Dependent variable=rank (within 4) achieved** |                   |                             |                             |
| constant                | 2.466                      | 2.471                       | 2.481                       |
| earned                  | -0.005                     | 0.059                       | 0.034                       |
| filling                 | 0.015                      | 0.053                       | 0.018                       |
| unemployed              | 0.051                      | 0.059                       | 0.034                       |
| employed                | 0.041                      | 0.053                       | 0.018                       |

Notes: Coefficients and corresponding standard errors from linear regressions presented; in the case of rank (within 4) ordered probits yield similar results; *** significant at the 1% level; ** significant at the 5% level; * significant at the 10% level.
### Table A4.ii
Regression analysis of pots processed, initial endowments received, and ranks (within 4) achieved, Cape Town data, comparison of middle and high income versus low income and poor

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sample</th>
<th>All participants Cape Town</th>
<th>Earned treatment Cape Town</th>
<th>Random treatment Cape Town</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Dependent variable=pots processed</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>coef</td>
<td>se</td>
<td>coef</td>
<td>se</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constant</td>
<td>38.162</td>
<td>0.810</td>
<td>20.088</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Earned</td>
<td>-0.895</td>
<td>1.033</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Filling</td>
<td>-17.439</td>
<td>1.159</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low income and poor</td>
<td>-2.450</td>
<td>0.810</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Dependent variable=initial endowment received</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>coef</td>
<td>se</td>
<td>coef</td>
<td>se</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constant</td>
<td>0.252</td>
<td>0.019</td>
<td>0.251</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Earned</td>
<td>0.001</td>
<td>0.024</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Filling</td>
<td>-0.001</td>
<td>0.027</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low income and poor</td>
<td>0.001</td>
<td>0.019</td>
<td>-0.005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Dependent variable=rank (within 4) achieved</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>coef</td>
<td>se</td>
<td>coef</td>
<td>se</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constant</td>
<td>2.466</td>
<td>0.182</td>
<td>2.471</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Earned</td>
<td>-0.005</td>
<td>0.235</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Filling</td>
<td>0.015</td>
<td>0.263</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low income and poor</td>
<td>0.051</td>
<td>0.184</td>
<td>0.059</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Notes: Coefficients and corresponding standard errors from linear regressions presented; in the case of rank (within 4) ordered probits yield similar results; *** significant at the 1% level; ** significant at the 5% level; * significant at the 10% level.

In both locations we see evidence of differences in the number of pots processed across participant types and across processing tasks and, in Oxford we see evidence of a difference in the number of pots processed across treatments (earned vs. random). However, we see no evidence of variations in initial endowments or within-4 rank across any of these dimensions in either location. These results indicate that our protocol succeeded.
Another way of approaching this issue of whether our protocol successfully ensured balance across participant types with regard to initial endowments in the 4PDG in the earned treatment, is to look at the strength of the relationship between the number of pots processed and initial endowments under that treatment. In tables A5 and A6 we report standard R²s for simple bivariate regressions of initial endowments on pots processed and within R²’s for regressions with session fixed effects. The tables show that the relationship was strong and, in general, similarly strong across participant types.

### Table A5
**Strength of correlations between initial endowments and pots processed in the earned treatment, Oxford data**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>All</th>
<th>Students</th>
<th>Employed</th>
<th>Unemployed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Filling task</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R² of bivariate regression</td>
<td>0.71</td>
<td>0.60</td>
<td>0.84</td>
<td>0.83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>within R² of session f.e. regression</td>
<td>0.78</td>
<td>0.80</td>
<td>0.88</td>
<td>0.84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Emptying task</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R² of bivariate regression</td>
<td>0.86</td>
<td>0.89</td>
<td>0.89</td>
<td>0.98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>within R² of session f.e. regression</td>
<td>0.86</td>
<td>0.89</td>
<td>0.89</td>
<td>0.98</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table A6
**Strength of correlations between initial endowments and pots processed in the earned treatment, Cape Town data**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>All</th>
<th>Students</th>
<th>Employed</th>
<th>Unemployed</th>
<th>Middle and high income</th>
<th>Low income and poor</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Filling task</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R² of bivariate reg.</td>
<td>0.70</td>
<td>0.74</td>
<td>0.83</td>
<td>0.76</td>
<td>0.74</td>
<td>0.75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>within R² of session f.e. reg.</td>
<td>0.81</td>
<td>0.84</td>
<td>0.87</td>
<td>0.80</td>
<td>0.82</td>
<td>0.82</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Finally, given the significant differences in pot processing performance across participant types, we need to check that our protocol had its desired effect of balancing within-4 ranks and initial endowments across participant types even when there was a mix of types within a session. Table A7 presents a series of regressions in which a participant under the earned treatment is an observation, their rank (within-4) is the dependent variable and the proportion of participants within their session that are each...
of the other types are the explanatory variables. A separate regression is run for each type of participant in each location.

Table A7
Regression analysis of rank by subject-type with session-mix explanatory variables
Dependent variable = rank (within 4): Samples: earned treatment only

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Oxford</th>
<th>Cape Town</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Students</td>
<td>Employed</td>
<td>Unemployed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>coef  se</td>
<td>coef  se</td>
<td>Coef  se</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proportion of subjects in session who were...</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employed</td>
<td>-2.209 2.836</td>
<td>0.338 0.738</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unemployed</td>
<td>-0.491 1.409</td>
<td>0.530 1.331</td>
<td>0.902 1.065</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students</td>
<td>0.492 1.995</td>
<td>0.902 1.065</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constant</td>
<td>2.508*** 0.205 ***</td>
<td>2.539*** 0.317 ***</td>
<td>2.392*** 0.318 ***</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

|                      | Students                      | Employed                      | Unemployed           |
|                      | coef  se                      | coef  se                      | Coef  se             |
| Proportion of subjects in session who were... |                      |                      |                      |
| Employed             | -0.754 1.391                  | 0.339 1.338                  |                      |
| Unemployed           | 0.390 1.436                   | -0.097 0.720                 | -0.239 2.561         |
| Students             | 0.330 0.813                   | -0.239 2.561                 |                      |
| Constant             | 2.518 0.166 ***               | 2.502 0.286 ***              | 2.448 0.397 ***      |

|                      | Middle and high income        | Low income and poor           |
|                      | coef  se                      | coef  se                      |
| Proportion of subjects in session who were... |                      |                      |                      |
| Low income or poor   | -0.114 0.672                  | 0.161 0.516                  |                      |
| Constant             | 2.563 0.277 ***               | 2.372 0.370 ***              |

Notes: Coefficients and corresponding standard errors from linear regressions presented; ordered probits yield similar results; *** significant at the 1% level; ** significant at the 5% level; * significant at the 10% level.

Table A7 reveals that mixed sessions had no impact of participants’ within-4 ranks under the earned treatment. A similar set of regressions, but taking initial endowment as the dependent variable, leads to the same findings.
Further analysis of South African student sample

We investigate the conjecture that the South African students do not exhibit an EEE because they are heterogeneous in terms of their economic status and, while those from relatively well off households acknowledge earned entitlement, the relatively poor do not, in Table A8. In Table A8 the first column contains the model presented in the first column of Table 6 in the paper, the second column contains the same model estimated for the sample of students who indicated that their households were middle or high income or rich and the third column contains the same model estimated for the sample of students who indicated that their households were low income or poor.

Table A8
Comparing the allocation decisions of students from relatively well off and relatively poor households

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dependent variable = participant i's final allocation to participant j</th>
<th>All students</th>
<th>Students from middle or high income or rich households</th>
<th>Students from low income or poor households</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Earned treatment (E)</td>
<td>-0.015</td>
<td>-0.049*</td>
<td>0.046</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(0.026)</td>
<td>(0.028)</td>
<td>(0.052)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>j's initial endowment (yj)</td>
<td>0.065</td>
<td>0.001</td>
<td>0.149*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(0.049)</td>
<td>(0.050)</td>
<td>(0.085)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>yj x E</td>
<td>0.095</td>
<td>0.202**</td>
<td>-0.078</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(0.089)</td>
<td>(0.097)</td>
<td>(0.171)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constant</td>
<td>0.175***</td>
<td>0.195***</td>
<td>0.141***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(0.019)</td>
<td>(0.020)</td>
<td>(0.037)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Observations</td>
<td>288</td>
<td>201</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Notes: Unit of analysis an allocation by i to j; allocations to self (i=j) excluded; coefficients from linear regressions presented; standard errors in parentheses; standard errors clustered to account for non-independence within i; *** significant at the 1% level; ** significant at the 5% level; * significant at the 10% level.

The table reveals that the relatively well off students exhibit an earned endowment effect, the relatively poor students do not.
Adding control variables to Model 2

Controlling for selfishness

In the theoretical model selfishness is captured by $\beta_i$. More selfish individuals have lower $\beta_i$. In our empirical specifications the effects of selfishness, $\beta_i$, on allocations to others are included in the error term. So, if selfishness is correlated with any of the explanatory variables in the model, the estimated coefficients will be biased.

We can control for this source of bias by including allocator ($i$) fixed effects in the estimations. Once allocator fixed effects are introduced, we cannot estimate the coefficient $a_3$ in Model 1 for each participant sub-sample or the coefficients $a_4$ or $a_5$ in Model 2. However, we can estimate the remainder of the coefficients and, thereby, check the robustness of our prior estimates to the inclusion of the fixed effects.

Table A9

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Students</th>
<th>Employed</th>
<th>Unemployed</th>
<th>All Unemployed receiving transfers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>j’s initial endowment (yi)</td>
<td>0.032</td>
<td>0.064</td>
<td>0.071</td>
<td>0.045</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.040)</td>
<td>(0.049)</td>
<td>(0.046)</td>
<td>(0.032)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>yi x E</td>
<td>0.279***</td>
<td>0.250***</td>
<td>0.121*</td>
<td>0.268***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.056)</td>
<td>(0.065)</td>
<td>(0.063)</td>
<td>(0.044)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>yi x Unemployed</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>yi x Unemployed x E</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constant</td>
<td>0.163***</td>
<td>0.180***</td>
<td>0.185***</td>
<td>0.175***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.008)</td>
<td>(0.009)</td>
<td>(0.009)</td>
<td>(0.005)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Observations</td>
<td>219</td>
<td>168</td>
<td>174</td>
<td>561</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Notes: Unit of analysis an allocation by i to j; allocations to self (j=i) excluded; coefficients from linear regressions including fixed effects for i presented; standard errors in parentheses; *** significant at the 1% level; ** significant at the 5% level; * significant at the 10% level.
The fixed effects estimations for the Oxford and Cape Town participant samples are presented in Tables A9 and A10 respectively.

Table A10
Adding individual fixed effects to the regression analysis of allocations to others in Cape Town
Dependent variable = participant i's final allocation to participant j

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Students</th>
<th>Employed</th>
<th>Unemployed</th>
<th>High economic status</th>
<th>Low economic status</th>
<th>All</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>j's initial endowment ($y_i$)</td>
<td>0.060</td>
<td>0.050</td>
<td>0.178***</td>
<td>0.061*</td>
<td>0.132***</td>
<td>0.061</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.045)</td>
<td>(0.046)</td>
<td>(0.056)</td>
<td>(0.037)</td>
<td>(0.041)</td>
<td>(0.043)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$y_i \times E$</td>
<td>0.105*</td>
<td>0.235***</td>
<td>0.041</td>
<td>0.231***</td>
<td>0.011</td>
<td>0.231***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.056)</td>
<td>(0.061)</td>
<td>(0.077)</td>
<td>(0.047)</td>
<td>(0.055)</td>
<td>(0.056)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$y_i \times \text{Low economic status (L)}$</td>
<td>0.071</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.057)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$y_i \times L \times E$</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-0.220***</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(0.074)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constant</td>
<td>0.164***</td>
<td>0.199***</td>
<td>0.189***</td>
<td>0.166***</td>
<td>0.195***</td>
<td>0.181***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.007)</td>
<td>(0.008)</td>
<td>(0.011)</td>
<td>(0.006)</td>
<td>(0.007)</td>
<td>(0.005)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Observations</td>
<td>288</td>
<td>213</td>
<td>189</td>
<td>327</td>
<td>363</td>
<td>690</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Notes: Unit of analysis an allocation by i to j; allocations to self ($j=i$) excluded; coefficients from linear regressions including fixed effects for i presented; standard errors in parentheses; *** significant at the 1% level; ** significant at the 5% level; * significant at the 10% level.

The tables indicate that all but one of our main findings are robust to the inclusion of fixed effects in the regressions models. The one exception is that when we include fixed effects in the model for the unemployed in Oxford, we find weak evidence of an EEE less than half the size of the EEE exhibited by students and the employed. To investigate this further, we removed allocations made by the 16 unemployed who were not receiving government transfers, from the sample and re-estimated the model. For this sample, there is no evidence of an EEE.

Controlling for other factors

Investigating the robustness of our main findings to the inclusion of other control variables that may be correlated with unemployment is non-trivial. This is because, in
addition to each control variable, we need to its interactions with $y_j$, $E$ and $y_j \times E$ and including multiple interactions involving the same variables in a regression leads to multicollinearity. To minimize this problem we extended Model 2 by introducing just one control variable and its corresponding interactions at a time. The control variables investigated in this way were: a dummy variable high indicating that initial endowments in i’s group were highly unequal (see footnote 5 in main text); a dummy variable filling indicating that i engaged in the real effort task involving pot filling rather than pot emptying; and the decision-making participant’s own initial endowment, $y_i$, age in years, sex (female=1 for women, zero for men), and education in years. For the Cape Town sample we also introduced a dummy variable African indicating that i was of African ethnicity. The sample mean of each of the three continuous control variables was subtracted from the variable prior to interaction and inclusion in the model. Thus, in the models containing such controls, the coefficients on the variables of principle interest can be interpreted as effects and conditional effects at the mean of the control variable and the coefficients on the control and corresponding interaction terms can be interpreted as effects of deviating from the mean of the control variable.

For the Oxford dataset the results of this exercise are presented in Table A11. The findings can be summarized as follows: with the exception of high and high interacted with $y_j$, none of the additional controls or interactions bore significant coefficients, although when education is included without corresponding interactions it bears a significant positive coefficient; in all cases, following the introduction of the control and corresponding interacts, the results reported in the main text of the paper are essentially unchanged, although in some cases the significance of the coefficients on unemployed and unemployed interacted with $E$ and $y_j \times E$ declines to the 10 percent level.
Table A11
Adding controls to the regression analysis of allocations to others in Oxford

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Control variable (CV)</th>
<th>filling</th>
<th>high</th>
<th>( y_i )</th>
<th>age</th>
<th>female</th>
<th>education</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(demeaned)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(demeaned)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Earned treatment (E)</td>
<td>-0.052**</td>
<td>-0.100***</td>
<td>-0.070***</td>
<td>-0.065***</td>
<td>-0.069**</td>
<td>-0.064***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.023)</td>
<td>(0.025)</td>
<td>(0.020)</td>
<td>(0.020)</td>
<td>(0.028)</td>
<td>(0.020)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>( y_j )’s initial endowment (( y_j ))</td>
<td>0.073**</td>
<td>-0.047</td>
<td>0.017</td>
<td>0.036</td>
<td>0.021</td>
<td>0.037</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.035)</td>
<td>(0.040)</td>
<td>(0.024)</td>
<td>(0.032)</td>
<td>(0.047)</td>
<td>(0.031)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>( y_j ) x E</td>
<td>0.226***</td>
<td>0.387***</td>
<td>0.311***</td>
<td>0.292***</td>
<td>0.261**</td>
<td>0.279***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.085)</td>
<td>(0.092)</td>
<td>(0.072)</td>
<td>(0.072)</td>
<td>(0.103)</td>
<td>(0.074)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unemployed</td>
<td>-0.023</td>
<td>-0.020</td>
<td>-0.026</td>
<td>-0.032</td>
<td>-0.025</td>
<td>-0.023</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.022)</td>
<td>(0.022)</td>
<td>(0.022)</td>
<td>(0.026)</td>
<td>(0.023)</td>
<td>(0.026)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unemployed x E</td>
<td>0.066*</td>
<td>0.061*</td>
<td>0.067**</td>
<td>0.070*</td>
<td>0.071**</td>
<td>0.065*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.034)</td>
<td>(0.032)</td>
<td>(0.032)</td>
<td>(0.036)</td>
<td>(0.033)</td>
<td>(0.037)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>( y_j ) x Unemployed</td>
<td>0.087</td>
<td>0.088</td>
<td>0.999*</td>
<td>0.105</td>
<td>0.102*</td>
<td>0.088</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.056)</td>
<td>(0.059)</td>
<td>(0.059)</td>
<td>(0.072)</td>
<td>(0.062)</td>
<td>(0.073)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>( y_j ) x Unemployed x E</td>
<td>-0.267**</td>
<td>-0.252**</td>
<td>-0.263**</td>
<td>-0.281**</td>
<td>-0.260**</td>
<td>-0.229*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.123)</td>
<td>(0.119)</td>
<td>(0.118)</td>
<td>(0.132)</td>
<td>(0.119)</td>
<td>(0.125)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Control variable (CV)</td>
<td>0.015</td>
<td>-0.048***</td>
<td>-0.115</td>
<td>0.001</td>
<td>-0.003</td>
<td>1.85e-4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.018)</td>
<td>(0.017)</td>
<td>(0.077)</td>
<td>(0.001)</td>
<td>(0.019)</td>
<td>(0.005)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CV x E</td>
<td>-0.023</td>
<td>0.048</td>
<td>0.109</td>
<td>-0.001</td>
<td>0.006</td>
<td>-0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.033)</td>
<td>(0.030)</td>
<td>(0.116)</td>
<td>(0.001)</td>
<td>(0.032)</td>
<td>(0.007)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CV x ( y_j )</td>
<td>-0.079</td>
<td>0.090**</td>
<td>0.270</td>
<td>-0.002</td>
<td>0.024</td>
<td>-0.002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.050)</td>
<td>(0.045)</td>
<td>(0.228)</td>
<td>(0.003)</td>
<td>(0.051)</td>
<td>(0.013)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CV x ( y_j ) x E</td>
<td>0.133</td>
<td>-0.100</td>
<td>-0.281</td>
<td>0.003</td>
<td>0.072</td>
<td>0.036</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.117)</td>
<td>(0.106)</td>
<td>(0.431)</td>
<td>(0.005)</td>
<td>(0.115)</td>
<td>(0.025)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constant</td>
<td>0.198***</td>
<td>0.240***</td>
<td>0.212***</td>
<td>0.207***</td>
<td>0.207***</td>
<td>0.205***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.014)</td>
<td>(0.013)</td>
<td>(0.010)</td>
<td>(0.011)</td>
<td>(0.015)</td>
<td>(0.010)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Joint sig. (p-value) of CV and related interactions: 0.516 0.085 0.684 0.542 0.171 0.057

Notes: The model in each column includes a different control variable (CV) and, with the exception of the far right-hand column, interactions between that control variable and E, \( y_j \), and \( y_j \) x E; the heading at the top of each column indicates the control variable (and corresponding interactions) included in the model in that column; high equals 1 for i in groups with highly unequal initial endowments; filling equals 1 for i engaged in the pot filling task, zero for i engaged in the pot emptying task; \( y_j \) is i’s initial endowment (demeaned before interaction and inclusion); age is i’s age in years (demeaned before interaction and inclusion); female equals 1 for women, 0 for men; education is i’s education in years (demeaned before interaction and inclusion); coefficients and corresponding standard errors presented; standard errors clustered by participant; *** significant at 1% level, ** significant at 5% level, * significant at 1% level.
The results for the Cape Town sample are presented in Table A12. Once again, the controls and corresponding interactions rarely bear significant coefficients. However, the results reported in the main text of the paper for Cape Town are not quite as robust as those for Oxford. They remain essentially unchanged following the introduction of filling, high, y, African, and age, even though, in the case of the latter, the control and corresponding interaction terms are jointly significant. However, when female and corresponding interaction terms or education and corresponding interaction terms are introduced, the significance of some of the variables of principle interest is eliminated. While this is a concern, further investigations go some way towards its mitigation. First, note that female and its corresponding interaction terms are not jointly significant when added to the model. Further, when only female uninteracted is included it is insignificant, while the findings of principle interest return to significance (results not tabulated). Turning to education, while it and its corresponding interaction terms are jointly significant at the 10 percent level, further investigation reveals that this significance is driven by education uninteracted and when only education uninteracted is included in the model the findings of principle interest return to significance. While not conclusive, these investigations suggest that the fragility of the Cape Town findings is owing to the multicollinearity generated by including multiple interaction terms involving common elements rather than the controls being critical determinants of the earned endowment effect.
Table A12
Adding controls to the regression analysis of allocations to others in Cape Town

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Control variable (CV)</th>
<th>filling (demeaned)</th>
<th>high (demeaned)</th>
<th>yj (demeaned)</th>
<th>African (demeaned)</th>
<th>age (demeaned)</th>
<th>female</th>
<th>education (demeaned)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Earned treatment (E)</td>
<td>-0.059**</td>
<td>-0.074**</td>
<td>-0.055***</td>
<td>-0.051**</td>
<td>-0.052**</td>
<td>-0.031</td>
<td>-0.050** -0.057***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.026)</td>
<td>(0.030)</td>
<td>(0.020)</td>
<td>(0.023)</td>
<td>(0.021)</td>
<td>(0.033)</td>
<td>(0.022) (0.021)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>j’s initial endowment (yi)</td>
<td>0.109***</td>
<td>0.011</td>
<td>0.051</td>
<td>0.030</td>
<td>0.053*</td>
<td>0.039</td>
<td>0.102** 0.065*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.041)</td>
<td>(0.066)</td>
<td>(0.032)</td>
<td>(0.035)</td>
<td>(0.032)</td>
<td>(0.069)</td>
<td>(0.049) (0.033)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>yj x E</td>
<td>0.297***</td>
<td>0.310***</td>
<td>0.228***</td>
<td>0.168**</td>
<td>0.233***</td>
<td>0.154</td>
<td>0.192** 0.215***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.083)</td>
<td>(0.106)</td>
<td>(0.073)</td>
<td>(0.084)</td>
<td>(0.074)</td>
<td>(0.124)</td>
<td>(0.082) (0.075)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low Economic status (L)</td>
<td>-0.013</td>
<td>-0.013</td>
<td>-0.012</td>
<td>-0.005</td>
<td>-0.018</td>
<td>-0.015</td>
<td>-0.006 -0.024</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.020)</td>
<td>(0.020)</td>
<td>(0.020)</td>
<td>(0.019)</td>
<td>(0.020)</td>
<td>(0.021)</td>
<td>(0.021) (0.022)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L x E</td>
<td>0.056*</td>
<td>0.056*</td>
<td>0.059**</td>
<td>0.056*</td>
<td>0.058*</td>
<td>0.059**</td>
<td>0.049 0.060*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.029)</td>
<td>(0.029)</td>
<td>(0.030)</td>
<td>(0.031)</td>
<td>(0.030)</td>
<td>(0.032)</td>
<td>(0.031)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>yj x L</td>
<td>0.082</td>
<td>0.088</td>
<td>0.088</td>
<td>0.063</td>
<td>0.099</td>
<td>0.105</td>
<td>0.036 0.100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.068)</td>
<td>(0.071)</td>
<td>(0.069)</td>
<td>(0.066)</td>
<td>(0.072)</td>
<td>(0.074)</td>
<td>(0.070) (0.074)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>yj x L x E</td>
<td>-0.191*</td>
<td>-0.201*</td>
<td>-0.212*</td>
<td>-0.210*</td>
<td>-0.238**</td>
<td>-0.217*</td>
<td>-0.175 -0.209*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.110)</td>
<td>(0.111)</td>
<td>(0.109)</td>
<td>(0.114)</td>
<td>(0.117)</td>
<td>(0.113)</td>
<td>(0.115) (0.115)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Control variable (CV)</td>
<td>0.007</td>
<td>-0.014</td>
<td>0.010</td>
<td>-0.036*</td>
<td>0.001</td>
<td>0.010</td>
<td>0.004 -0.003**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.020)</td>
<td>(0.020)</td>
<td>(0.102)</td>
<td>(0.021)</td>
<td>(0.021)</td>
<td>(0.024)</td>
<td>(0.006) (0.001)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CV x E</td>
<td>0.016</td>
<td>-0.164</td>
<td>-0.008</td>
<td>-0.001</td>
<td>-0.038</td>
<td>-0.002</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.030)</td>
<td>(0.129)</td>
<td>(0.031)</td>
<td>(0.001)</td>
<td>(0.001)</td>
<td>(0.033)</td>
<td>(0.007)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CV x yj</td>
<td>-0.127***</td>
<td>0.057</td>
<td>-0.189</td>
<td>0.088</td>
<td>4.53e-4</td>
<td>0.030</td>
<td>-0.024</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.061)</td>
<td>(0.067)</td>
<td>(0.354)</td>
<td>(0.075)</td>
<td>(0.003)</td>
<td>(0.087)</td>
<td>(0.021)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CV x yj x E</td>
<td>-0.103</td>
<td>0.715</td>
<td>0.095</td>
<td>0.004</td>
<td>0.100</td>
<td>0.004</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.107)</td>
<td>(0.474)</td>
<td>(0.120)</td>
<td>(0.005)</td>
<td>(0.127)</td>
<td>(0.026)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constant</td>
<td>0.199***</td>
<td>0.214***</td>
<td>0.203***</td>
<td>0.217***</td>
<td>0.203***</td>
<td>0.196***</td>
<td>0.195*** 0.205***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.013)</td>
<td>(0.020)</td>
<td>(0.012)</td>
<td>(0.014)</td>
<td>(0.012)</td>
<td>(0.021)</td>
<td>(0.015) (0.012)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Joint sig. (p-value) of CV and interactions</td>
<td>0.039</td>
<td>0.759</td>
<td>0.308</td>
<td>0.112</td>
<td>0.0002</td>
<td>0.389</td>
<td>0.057</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Notes: The model in each column includes a different control variable (CV) and, with the exception of the far right-hand column, interactions between that control variable and E, yj, and yj x E; the heading at the top of each column indicates the control variable (and corresponding interactions) included in the model in that column; high equals 1 for i in groups with highly unequal initial endowments; filling equals 1 for i engaged in the pot filling task, zero for i engaged in the pot emptying task; yj is i’s initial endowment (demeaned before interaction and inclusion); African equals 1 for i of African ethnic origin, 0 otherwise; age is i’s age in years (demeaned before interaction and inclusion); female equals 1 for women, 0 for men; education is i’s education in years (demeaned before interaction and inclusion); coefficients and corresponding standard errors presented; standard errors clustered by participant; *** significant at 1% level; ** significant at 5% level, * significant at 1% level.

Finally, we included a set of dummy variables indicating i’s initial endowment rank within the group of four (Rank 2 was the omitted category) and all the interactions between these dummies and yj, E and yj x E. So, twelve additional regressors in total.
When introduced into the model for the Oxford sample, these twelve regressors were jointly insignificant (only one of the twelve was individually significant) and had only minimal effects on our main results; the coefficient on the earned treatment dummy declined in absolute magnitude to -0.053 (from -0.064) and lost significance (p-value=0.135) and the coefficient on $y_j \times \text{Unemployed}$ increased in magnitude to 0.10 (from 0.092) and gained significance at the 10 percent level. When introduced into the model for the Cape Town sample, these twelve regressors were jointly insignificant (only two of the twelve were individually significant) and had essentially no effect on our main results.

**Further exploratory analysis of the Oxford data and the two datasets pooled**

The findings from the Cape Town experiment indicated that individual tendencies to acknowledge effort and productivity are associated with participants’ relative economic status rather than their current or anticipated labour market status. This caused us to wonder whether we could improve our analysis of the Oxford data by accounting for differences in economic status within types. In Oxford we did not ask participants whether their households were rich, upper income, middle income, low income, or poor. However, we knew that our unemployed sample included some who were not receiving cash transfers from the government and judged it reasonable to assume that they would be of higher economic status. Similarly, we knew that our student sample included both university and FE students and judged it reasonable to assume that the FE students would originate from households with relatively low economic status.\(^1\) Among the

---

\(^1\) Further, McIntosh (2006) shows that UK FE graduates earn less, on average, than UK university graduates in later life, i.e., the FE graduates can expect less upward mobility.
employed, 44 of the 62 answered a question about which income bracket their household fell into potentially allowing us to distinguish between high and low economic status individuals in that sub-sample also.

Table A13
Further regression analysis of allocations to others in Oxford

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Unemployed no gov't transfer</th>
<th>Unemployed with gov't transfer</th>
<th>University students</th>
<th>FE students</th>
<th>University and FE students compared</th>
<th>High and low economic status compared#</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>j's initial endowment (yj)</td>
<td>-0.014*</td>
<td>0.147**</td>
<td>0.025</td>
<td>0.019</td>
<td>0.025</td>
<td>0.036</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.007)</td>
<td>(0.058)</td>
<td>(0.044)</td>
<td>(0.028)</td>
<td>(0.044)</td>
<td>(0.032)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Earned treatment (E)</td>
<td>-0.037</td>
<td>-0.003</td>
<td>-0.067**</td>
<td>0.019</td>
<td>-0.067**</td>
<td>-0.059***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.025)</td>
<td>(0.032)</td>
<td>(0.028)</td>
<td>(0.026)</td>
<td>(0.029)</td>
<td>(0.019)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>yi x E</td>
<td>0.242*</td>
<td>-0.018</td>
<td>0.330***</td>
<td>-0.036</td>
<td>0.330***</td>
<td>0.285***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.117)</td>
<td>(0.125)</td>
<td>(0.105)</td>
<td>(0.102)</td>
<td>(0.106)</td>
<td>(0.066)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Further education (FE)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>0.026</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(0.025)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FE x E</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>0.086**</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(0.039)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>yi x FE</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-0.006</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(0.054)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>yi x FE x E</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-0.366**</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(0.144)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low economic status (L)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-0.018</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(0.020)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L x E</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>0.065**</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(0.032)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>yi x L</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>0.078</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(0.054)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>yi x L x E</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-0.302**</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(0.129)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constant</td>
<td>0.223***</td>
<td>0.176***</td>
<td>0.187***</td>
<td>0.213***</td>
<td>0.187***</td>
<td>0.204***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.006)</td>
<td>(0.023)</td>
<td>(0.016)</td>
<td>(0.020)</td>
<td>(0.017)</td>
<td>(0.011)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Observations</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>126</td>
<td>165</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>219</td>
<td>561</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Notes: Unit of analysis is an allocation by i to j; allocations to self (j=i) excluded; coefficients from linear regressions presented; standard errors in parentheses; standard errors clustered to account for non-independence within i; *** significant at the 1% level; ** significant at the 5% level; * significant at the 10% level; # high economic status includes university students, the employed, and the unemployed who do not receive government transfers, low economic status includes students in colleges of further education and the unemployed who are receiving government transfers.
The outcome of this investigation is presented in Table A13. The first and second columns of Table A13 contain estimations of Model 1 for unemployed participants who are not and who are receiving government transfers respectively. For the unemployed not receiving a transfer, the coefficient on the interaction between initial endowments and the earned treatment identifier, $y_j x E$, is positive and significant. This is consistent with an EEE and so too is the negative coefficient on the earned treatment identifier uninteracted, although the latter is insignificant. For the unemployed receiving a transfer, there is no evidence of an EEE and, once again, we see evidence of the conditioning of allocations on initial endowments even when those initial endowments are randomly assigned.

The third and fourth columns of Table A13 contain estimations of Model 1 for university and FE students respectively. The estimation for the university students reveals an EEE, the coefficient on $y_j x E$ is positive and significant, while the coefficient on $E$ uninteracted is negative and significant. However, for the FE students there is no evidence of an EEE. In the fifth column the two types of student are pooled and an appropriately adjusted version of Model 2 is estimated to reveal that the university and FE students are distinct with regard to their notions of distributive justice. However, a similar analysis of the unemployed revealed that those receiving and not receiving transfers were not statistically distinguishable in the same way (estimation not tabulated). None of our analyses of the employed sub-sample yielded significant findings.

Using an adjusted version of Model 2 to compare, first, FE students and the unemployed and, second, the unemployed not receiving benefits and the employed
revealed no statistically significant behavioural differences. So, in the final column of Table A13 we estimate another appropriately adjusted version of Model 2 in which university students, the employed, and the unemployed not receiving transfers are treated as a single sub-sample of relatively high economic status individuals, FE students and the unemployed who are receiving transfers are treated as a separate sub-sample of relatively low economic status individuals and the two sub-samples are compared. Thus, we see that the two sub-samples are different, the high status sample is subject to an EEE, and according to linear restriction tests (H₀: \( a_1 + a_5 = 0 \) and H₀: \( a_3 + a_7 = 0 \)) the low status sub-sample is not. However, dividing the sample with reference to assumed economic status rather than known employment status only marginally improved the fit of the model.

Finally, with a considerable degree of circumspection, we could not resist pooling the Oxford and Cape Town samples in order to test for cross-context differences. The first column in Table A14 presents a version of Model 2 that distinguishes between high and low status participants in Oxford (previously presented in the final column of Table A14). The second column of Table A14 presents the same model for participants in Cape Town (previously presented in the final column of Table 6 in the main text). The third and final column in Table A14 presents an extended version of Model 2 based on the data from both cities. This model contains all of the regressors used in the preceding two models, a binary variable indicating that a data point was generated in Cape Town and the interactions between that indicator variable and all of the other regressors.

---

2 The estimations are not tabulated but are available from the authors on request.
### Table A14
Regression analysis of Oxford and Cape Town data pooled

Dependent variable = participant i's final allocation to participant j
Excluded from the samples: allocations made by participants who allocate zero to everyone other than themselves

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Oxford</th>
<th>Cape Town</th>
<th>Oxford and Cape Town</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>j's initial endowment (yj)</strong></td>
<td>0.036</td>
<td>0.061*</td>
<td>0.036</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.032)</td>
<td>(0.032)</td>
<td>(0.032)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Earned treatment (E)</strong></td>
<td>-0.059***</td>
<td>-0.056***</td>
<td>-0.059***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.019)</td>
<td>(0.020)</td>
<td>(0.019)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>yj x E</strong></td>
<td>0.285***</td>
<td>0.218***</td>
<td>0.285***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.066)</td>
<td>(0.075)</td>
<td>(0.066)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Low Economic Status (L)</strong></td>
<td>-0.018</td>
<td>-0.013</td>
<td>-0.018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.020)</td>
<td>(0.020)</td>
<td>(0.020)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>L x E</strong></td>
<td>0.065**</td>
<td>0.056*</td>
<td>0.065**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.032)</td>
<td>(0.030)</td>
<td>(0.032)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>L x yj</strong></td>
<td>0.078</td>
<td>0.091</td>
<td>0.078</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.054)</td>
<td>(0.072)</td>
<td>(0.054)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>L x yj x E</strong></td>
<td>-0.302**</td>
<td>-0.201*</td>
<td>-0.302**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.129)</td>
<td>(0.112)</td>
<td>(0.129)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cape Town (CT)</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-0.002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(0.016)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CT x yj</strong></td>
<td>0.025</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.045)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CT x E</strong></td>
<td>0.003</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.027)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CT x yj x E</strong></td>
<td>-0.067</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.100)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CT x L</strong></td>
<td>0.005</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.029)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CT x L x E</strong></td>
<td>-0.008</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.044)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CT x L x yj</strong></td>
<td>0.014</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.090)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CT x L x yj x E</strong></td>
<td>0.101</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.171)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Constant</strong></td>
<td>0.204***</td>
<td>0.202***</td>
<td>0.204***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.011)</td>
<td>(0.012)</td>
<td>(0.011)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Observations</strong></td>
<td>561</td>
<td>690</td>
<td>1251</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Joint sig. of CT and interactions involving CT (p-value) 0.870

Notes: Unit of analysis is an allocation by i to j; in Oxford, low economic status corresponds to being either unemployed or a student at a college of further education, in Cape Town, low economic status corresponds to self-reporting that one's family is low income or poor; allocations to self (j=i) excluded; coefficients from linear regressions presented; standard errors in parentheses; standard errors clustered to account for non-independence within i; *** significant at the 1% level; ** significant at the 5% level; * significant at the 10% level.

Neither the Cape Town indicator variable nor any of the new interaction terms bears a significant coefficient and they are also jointly insignificant. So, despite the minor
differences in the experiment between the two contexts (stakes and scripts) and the major differences in the way that high and low economic status participants are identified in the datasets, we cannot reject the hypothesis that the relationship between notions of distributive justice and relative economic status is common across these two very distinct contexts.

Finally, pooling offers one further advantage; it allows us to control for the possible non-independence of errors across participants within sessions.\(^3\) Clustering by session yields lower standard errors on the variables of principle interest, while leaving the coefficient on Cape Town and all of its interactions insignificant both individually and jointly.\(^4\)

**REFERENCES**


---

\(^3\) We could not do this when working on each dataset separately because, with only 15 sessions-worth of data, the clustered standard errors would have been biased.

\(^4\) The estimations are not tabulated but are available from the authors on request.
Protocols for DJ Experiments

to be conducted in Oxford, November-December 2010

Introduction

This document contains the protocols for the DJ experiments to be run in Oxford, November-December 2010. All the RAs need to be familiar with these protocols and the various materials used during the sessions.

Throughout, two types of tray are referred to: “real effort task trays” and “decision trays”. There are 16 of each. The former are grey and are each labeled with a letter (A to P). They hold yellow and blue gravel one or two (depending on treatment) rectangular containers and lots of small plastic pots (see photos (pot emptying real effort task tray not photographed yet)). The latter are cream and have lids. Each is labeled with a number (1 to 16) (see photo).

It is important that when the trays are being handed out to subjects and collected back in care is taken not to dislodge or drop the contents of the trays. It is the contents of the trays and the way they are arranged on the trays that constitutes our data.

Preparation of materials

Here is the list of materials that needs to be prepared before each session

1.  1 set of letter labels for the 16 lab cubicles that are to be used (each label bears a letter, A to P, each needs a strip of double-sided sticky tape on the back);

2.  16 photos of a decision tray with 44 counters lying beside it;

3.  Laminated letters (A to P)

4.  one set of letters on small pieces of paper folded and put in the cup (red and labeled “Letters A to P”)

5.  Numbers on small pieces of paper (2 sets of 1 to 16):
   i.  one set folded and put in a cup (red and labeled “Numbers 1 to 16”);
   ii. one set folded and distributed between four cups (acid yellow and labeled “Group 1”, “Group 2”, “Group 3”, and “Group 4”), the numbers should be distributed as follows:
      - Group 1: 1, 3, 10, 12
      - Group 2: 5, 7, 14, 16
      - Group 3: 2, 4, 9, 11
      - Group 4: 6, 8, 13, 15

6.  1 session form

7.  Post-it notes (16) each with a letter on it, A to P (these are to be stuck on decision tray lids when they have been allocated to subjects (more on this below))
8. 16 questionnaires prepared as indicated below.

9. 16 real effort task trays set up as indicated below.

10. 16 decision trays set up as indicated below.

**Things to do before each session**

1. Laminated letters (A to P) need to be put face down on desk directly outside lab. (Each subject selects one on arrival, they sit at the desk bearing the same letter and keep the letter until the end of the session when it they are used to identify them for payment)

2. A session form needs to be started (Luis to do this). Date, time, treatment, and task need to be recorded. Note that the subjects’ letters (A to P) are already filled in in the left-hand column of the form. These letters are the subjects’ ids and their physical addresses, i.e., their cubicle ids, for the session. All of the other data entered onto this form needs to be matched to these letters

3. The letter labels (A to P) need to be stuck on the top-outside edge of the far (from lab door) wall of each cubicle in accordance with the map in Figure 1 below;

4. A photo of a decision tray with 44 counters lying beside it needs to be stuck on the right-hand wall of each cubicle;

5. The real effort task trays need to be set up in accordance with the session type:
   i. For filling sessions there need to be 30 empty small plastic pots on the tray along with a container of mixed yellow and blue gravel (see photo);
   ii. For emptying sessions there need to be 50 filled small plastic pots on the tray along with two empty rectangular containers (photo to come);

6. One real effort task tray should be placed on the desk in each cubicle. The letter on the tray must match the letter on the cubicle wall;

7. Extra real effort task materials may have to be distributed to subjects who are fast:
   i. For the filling task, put the bag of spare empty pots and a tray of mixed gravel in the lab by the desk near the door
   ii. For the emptying task, put the bag of spare full pots by the desk near the door;

8. The decision trays need to be set up in accordance with Figure 2 (this must be done with care);

9. The decision trays should be laid out on the table in the seminar room, decision tray 1 at one end, decision tray 16 at the other, and the rest in order in between.

10. The date and time of the session needs to be entered on each of the 16 questionnaires. A letter (A to P) should be written in the “Your letter id for the session” box.

11. Set up a laptop in the seminar room. Open the Excel spreadsheet “Payoff calculator.xls” on the laptop and save as “Session ddMonth2010.xls”. Leave it open ready to enter the data.
Tasks to be performed by experimental team during the session

1. Subjects should be asked to pick a letter from the table outside the lab on arrival. They should then be directed to the cubicle bearing the same letter and told to keep the letter until the end of the session when they are paid.

2. When the person reading the session script tells the subjects to stop filling/emptying pots, the real effort task trays need to be collected and taken to the seminar room. Before they are collected, the RAs should encourage subjects to put all of the materials back on the trays.

3. In earned treatment sessions,
   i. the filled/emptied pots on each real effort task tray need to be counted and the count recorded next to the subjects' id letter on the session form
   ii. the pot counts need to be translated into performance ranks
   iii. then, using Table 1 (below), the decision trays should be assigned to subjects with reference to their performance rank
   iv. the number of the decision tray being assigned to each subject needs to be recorded on the session form and in the “payoff calculator spreadsheet” being careful to put the correct tray number next to each subjects’ letter
   v. then, each decision tray needs to be labeled with a post-it note bearing the letter of the receiving subject
   vi. once the decision trays have been labeled with letter-bearing post-it notes, they can be sorted into piles (one for each line of cubicles) and taken to the lab

4. In unearned treatment sessions,
   i. the filled/emptied pots on each tray do not need to be counted until the end of the session or when there is a quiet moment
   ii. which subject gets which decision tray is randomly determined by picking letters and numbers from cups (the two red cups).
   iii. one letter is drawn and one number is drawn
   iv. the post-it note bearing the drawn letter is put on the decision tray bearing the drawn number (so this decision tray is to be delivered to the subject with this letter)
   v. 16 number-letter draws are made.
   vi. the drawn letters and numbers are not put back in the cups until all 16 decision trays have been assigned
   vii. while the assigning is ongoing, the letters and numbers are set aside in separate piles (a pile of letters and a pile of numbers). Once all the draws have been made the letters are refolded and put in the letter cup and the numbers are refolded and put in the number cup.
   viii. the number of the tray being assigned to each subject needs to be recorded on the session form and in the “payoff calculator spreadsheet” being careful to put the right tray number next to each subjects’ letter
   ix. Then, the decision trays need to be labeled with post-it notes bearing the letter of the receiving subjects.
   x. once the decision trays have been labeled with letter-bearing post-it notes, they can be sorted into piles (one for each line of cubicles by letters) and taken to the lab
5. When the person reading the session script says so, the decision trays can be delivered to the cubicles, taking care to match the letter on the post-it note to the letter on the cubicle.

6. When people raise their hands indicating that they have finished making their decisions, the decision trays can be collected back in and taken to the seminar room.

7. Once all the decision trays are in, the questionnaires can be handed out. Be sure to match the letters on the questionnaires, to the letters on the cubicles.

8. The questionnaires can be collected once they are complete.

9. **To determine earnings**, one decision tray number has to be randomly picked from each “Group cup” (the yellow cups). I recommend: taking one cup from the set of four; making a random draw from that one cup; recording the number drawn on the session form by placing a “1” next to the picked tray number in the appropriate column; refolding the number and putting it back in the cup; putting that cup to one side (not back with the others); taking another cup and repeating; taking another cup and repeating; and then taking the last cup and repeating. This approach will minimize human error (e.g., drawing two numbers from the same cup) and will ensure that all the numbers are in the right cups ready for the next session.

10. The picked decision tray numbers indicated on the session form also need to be indicated in the same way in the “payoff calculator spreadsheet”.

11. The picked decision trays need to be separated from the rest and the counters in each of the segments counted up and entered into the appropriate row and in the “payoff calculator spreadsheet”. Do not rearrange the counters at this stage.

12. Enter the numbers of counters in each segment (blue left, top, right) on these 4 decision trays into the payoff calculator spreadsheet (in the appropriate rows)

13. The spreadsheet will return the payoffs for all subjects (if the payoff calculator fails in some way, Table 2 below can be used to calculate the payoffs manually)

14. Save the spreadsheet using a new name indicating the date and time of the session (the rest of the data will be filled in after the session)

15. The payoffs should then be transcribed onto receipts, adding the set aside earnings of £4.

16. The decision trays should be photographed (be sure that the counters are in a single layer and that the tray number is captured on the photo). Then, the counters in each segment of each decision tray should be counted and entered onto the session form and into the spreadsheet saved after the payoffs have been calculated. Please take care to enter the data correctly.

17. Make sure session form is complete and clear.

18. Staple the session form and the questionnaires together.

19. Prepare for next session
Figure 1: Map of the lab showing which letters will be stuck in which cubicles

**Note:** These letters are both the subject ids and the “addresses” used throughout each experimental session.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A</th>
<th>F</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th>K</th>
<th>N</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>G</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>L</td>
<td>O</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>H</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>P</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td>I</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E</td>
<td>J</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Door
Figure 2: Set up of the 16 trays for each session
Table 1: Assigning trays according to performance in task

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject rank for task performance</th>
<th>Tray number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>most pots =</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>fewest pots=</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 2: Payment allocations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Group 1</strong></td>
<td><strong>If Tray 1 is picked</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject who played with Tray 1 gets value of counters in</td>
<td>blue quadrant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject who played with Tray 3 gets value of counters in</td>
<td>opposite quadrant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject who played with Tray 10 gets value of counters in</td>
<td>righthand quadrant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject who played with Tray 12 gets value of counters in</td>
<td>lefthand quadrant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Group 2</strong></td>
<td><strong>If Tray 5 is picked</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject who played with Tray 5 gets value of counters in</td>
<td>blue quadrant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject who played with Tray 7 gets value of counters in</td>
<td>opposite quadrant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject who played with Tray 14 gets value of counters in</td>
<td>righthand quadrant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject who played with Tray 16 gets value of counters in</td>
<td>lefthand quadrant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Group 3</strong></td>
<td><strong>If Tray 2 is picked</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject who played with Tray 2 gets value of counters in</td>
<td>blue quadrant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject who played with Tray 4 gets value of counters in</td>
<td>opposite quadrant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject who played with Tray 9 gets value of counters in</td>
<td>righthand quadrant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject who played with Tray 11 gets value of counters in</td>
<td>lefthand quadrant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Group 4</strong></td>
<td><strong>If Tray 6 is picked</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject who played with Tray 6 gets value of counters in</td>
<td>blue quadrant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject who played with Tray 8 gets value of counters in</td>
<td>opposite quadrant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject who played with Tray 13 gets value of counters in</td>
<td>righthand quadrant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject who played with Tray 15 gets value of counters in</td>
<td>lefthand quadrant</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Photo 1: Real Effort Task Tray for pot-filling sessions

Photo 2: Real Effort Task Tray for pot-emptying sessions
Photo 3: Decision Tray
Script for DJ Experiments
Oxford

EARNED – FILLING

[Before entering the lab subjects need to select a participant letter at random and be asked to sit at the desk bearing their participant letter. Record participant letters on the session form. Say to each...] Please keep this identification with you throughout the workshop. You will need it at the end to claim your payment.

[Once everyone is seated...] Thank you for coming here today and agreeing to take part in this workshop. We are now ready to begin so please could you all listen carefully to the instructions.

While the workshop is going on, please do not talk to anyone apart from me and my assistants. If you have any questions, please raise your hand and one of us will come to your desk and answer your question. If you talk to the people around you, you will be asked to leave.

There are three stages to the workshop. I am now going to explain what we want you to do in the first stage but please do not start the task until you are told to do so.

You are going to spend 7 minutes helping us sort out some materials that are to be used in a workshop sometime in the next day or so.

Each one of you will find a box of gravel and some small plastic pots on your desk. We would like you to put 7 pieces of blue gravel and 7 pieces of yellow gravel in each pot, making a total of 14 pieces of gravel in each one. Please be careful when counting the gravel. We will be running checks on the pots you fill and will have to discard any pots that do not have 7 pieces of blue gravel and 7 pieces of yellow gravel in. Also, make sure that the pot lids are closed properly once you have put the gravel in. We are not asking you to do this for free. You will be paid for helping us in this way.

The more pots you process, the more money you will have at the start of the second stage of the workshop. The people who process the most pots will start the second stage with a lot more money than the people who process the fewest.

Finally, if you are running out of pots or gravel please raise your hand and one of my assistants will bring you more.

Does anyone have any questions?

[Wait... answer as required...] Please now start filling pots. I will tell you when the 7 (seven) minutes is up.
[Note start time]

[After 7 minutes have passed ...] Please can everyone stop now, the 7 minutes have finished. Please raise both hands in the air and keep them there until one of my assistants comes to you. Thank you very much for your hard work. We will now come around and collect the trays, pots and gravel.
We will record the number of pots each one of you has filled, check that the counting has been done correctly and then set up the next stage of the experiment. This will take a few minutes. Please be patient and do not talk. I will explain the next stage of the workshop once we are ready.

(Rank the subjects according to how many small pots they filled. Disregard pots that clearly do not contain 7-7. Record the number of pots and their rank on the session form. Then, allocate trays to subjects according to Table 1 (which links ranks to tray numbers) at the end of this document. Record their tray numbers on the session form. Also write the participant/desk letters on the tray lids and the corresponding receipts.)

Alright, we are nearly ready to continue with the workshop. Thank you once again for the effort you put into filling the pots.

As promised, you will be paid for this. There are two parts to your pay:

First, £4 (four pounds) has been set aside for each of you. You will receive this at the end of the experiment.

Second, each of you has earned between £2 (two pounds) and £20 (twenty pounds) on top of the £4 (four pounds) and this money is going to be used in the second stage of the workshop. Whether you have earned £2 (two pounds) or £20 (twenty pounds) or some amount in between depends on how many pots you filled in the first stage of the workshop.

Now I am going to explain the second stage of the workshop and you will see how the second part of your earnings from the first stage come into it.

Please listen carefully as these instructions are very important.

Right! In a few minutes we are going to hand each of you a tray separated into four identically sized compartments. There will be several counters in each compartment. You will find a photo of a tray stuck on the right-hand wall of your work station. The little black round things to the right of the tray in the photo are counters. Each compartment on the tray relates to one of the people in this workshop and each counter is worth £1 (one pound). So, if there are 6 counters in one of the compartments it means that the person to which that compartment relates is starting the second stage of the experiment with £6 (six pounds). At the end of the workshop, these counters will be exchanged for real money.

In this stage of the workshop you are all going to be placed in groups of 4. This is why the trays have 4 compartments - one compartment for each of the 4 people in a group. The blue compartment is your compartment. The counters in this blue compartment indicate the amount of money you are starting out with.

So, if you earned £8 over and above the £4 already set aside for you from the pot-filling, then there will be 8 counters in the blue compartment.

The 3 cream compartments hold the counters that the other people in your group earned over and above the £4 already set aside for them.
You will never know who else is in your group - you will just know how much money they earned.

We are going to hand the trays out now so you can see how much money you and the other people in your group have at the start of this stage of the workshop. Each tray is covered by a lid - please only lift the lid when the tray is on your desk so that it cannot be seen by anyone else. It is important that each person keeps the contents of his or her tray private.

[Hand out the trays being careful to hand the right tray to the right participant. Meanwhile say...]

There are a total of 44 counters on each tray. Please do not remove any of the counters. It is very important that we get all the counters back. Also, please do not move the counters around until we tell you that you may do so. Please just have a look at the tray so you know how much money you have and everyone else in your group has at this point in the workshop.

Remember as you look at the tray, the person with the most counters in the group has the most money because they filled the most pots. The person with the fewest counters has the least money because they didn’t fill as many pots as others.

Everyone should now have a tray and should know how much money they and the other people in their group have for the second stage. If anyone does not understand their tray, or has any other questions please raise your hand?

OK. In this stage, if you choose, you can change the amounts of money that you and the other members of your group are to take home at the end of the workshop by moving the counters around the tray. In other words, you can take one or more £1 counters away from some people, including yourself, and give those £1 counters to other people, including yourself.

You can move the counters between compartments any way you choose until you are satisfied with the way they are distributed across the compartments. However, you are not allowed to take any counters completely off the tray. There are 44 counters on the trays now and all 44 counters need to be on the trays when they are returned to us.

Let me repeat that, as it is important. You can move the counters between compartments any way you choose until you are satisfied with the way they are distributed across the compartments. However, you are not allowed to take any counters completely off the tray. There are 44 counters on the trays now and all 44 counters need to be on the trays when they are returned to us.

Before you start moving the counters on your tray there is another important thing I need to mention. In each group of four, only 1 person’s decision about how to distribute the counters across compartments is going to be carried out. For each group, we will put the four tray numbers in this/cup and pick one at random. The money you receive at the end of the workshop, on top of the £4 already put aside, will depend on the decision made by the person whose tray number is picked. Every person’s decision has an equal chance of being the one that is carried out, so it is important that you think about your decision very carefully.
Finally, all the decisions you make will be kept secret – no-one else will ever know whether you were in their group or whether you moved money to them or away from them.

Remember that your compartment on the tray is blue.

If you do not understand what you are being asked to do or how it might affect yourself and others, or if you have any other questions, please raise your hand and we will come to you.

You may now make your decisions about whether and where to move counters. You can have as much time as you want. When you have arranged the counters as you see fit please close the lid of your tray and put up your hand. One of us will then collect your tray from you.

[When all trays collected...] One of my assistants will now come and give you a short questionnaire that we would like you to fill out. This questionnaire-filling is the third stage of the workshop and when it is finished you will be paid and will be free to leave. When you have finished filling in the questionnaire, raise your hand again. Please note that the questionnaire is on both sides of the paper.

[Hand out and later collect questionnaires. Calculate pay with reference to notes in next section of this document. Draw up receipts.]

We are now finished. Thank you for being so patient and thank you for participating in this workshop. We have worked out how much money each of you is to be paid. In a minute I will ask you to come to the desk just outside this door to receive and sign for your money. Then you will be free to leave.
Script DJ Experiments
Oxford

EARNED – EMPTYING

[Before entering the lab subjects need to select a participant letter at random and be asked to sit at the desk bearing their participant letter. Record participant letters on the session form. Say to each...] Please keep this identification with you throughout the workshop. You will need it at the end to claim your payment.

[Once everyone is seated...] Thank you for coming here today and agreeing to take part in this workshop. We are now ready to begin so please could you all listen carefully to the instructions.

While the workshop is going on, please do not talk to anyone apart from me and my assistants. If you have any questions, please raise your hand and one of us will come to your desk and answer your question. If you talk to the people around you, you will be asked to leave.

There are three stages to the workshop. I am now going to explain what we want you to do in the first stage but please do not start the task until you are told to do so.

You are going to spend seven minutes helping us sort out some materials that are to be used in a workshop sometime in the next day or so.

Each one of you will find some small plastic pots containing blue and yellow gravel and two larger containers. We would like you to empty the small pots and sort the gravel by colour, putting the blue gravel in one of the larger containers and the yellow gravel in the other. Open only one or two small pots at a time to ensure that, at the end of the task, all of the gravel that is NOT in small pots is sorted into the larger containers. Also, be gentle with the small pots - the lids are on hinges, please don’t break the hinges. We are not asking you to do this for free. You will be paid for helping us in this way.

The more pots you process, the more money you will have at the start of the second stage of the workshop. The people who process the most pots will start the second stage with a lot more money than the people who process the fewest. We will be spot checking by weight that all of the gravel, pots and containers are returned to us on your tray at the end of this stage. If your tray is underweight, you will be placed at the bottom of the earnings ranking.

Finally, if you are running out of pots or gravel please raise your hand and one of my assistants will bring you more.

Does anyone have any questions?

[Wait... answer as required...] Please now start emptying pots. I will tell you when the 7 (seven) minutes is up. [Note start time]
[After 7 minutes have passed...] Please can everyone stop now. Please raise both hands in the air and keep them there until one of my assistants comes to you. Thank you very much for your hard work. We will now come around and collect the trays, pots and gravel.

We will record the number of pots each one of you has emptied, check that the sorting has been done correctly and then set up the next stage of the experiment. This will take a few minutes. Please be patient and do not talk. I will explain the next stage of the workshop once we are ready.

[Rank the subjects according to how many small pots they emptied. Underweight trays should be treated as zero pots emptied in the experiment, although the number of pots emptied should still be recorded. Disregard pots from which the gravel has been left unsorted. Record the number of sorted pots and their rank on the session form. Then, allocate trays to subjects according to Table 1 (which links ranks to tray numbers) at the end of this document. Record their tray numbers on the session form. Also write the participant/desk letters on the tray lids and the corresponding receipts.]

Alright, we are nearly ready to continue with the workshop. Thank you once again for the effort you put into emptying the pots.

As promised, you will be paid for this. There are two parts to your pay:

First, £4 (four pounds) has been set aside for each of you. You will receive this at the end of the experiment.

Second, each of you has earned between £2 (two pounds) and £20 (twenty pounds) on top of the £4 (four pounds) and this money is going to be used in the second stage of the workshop. Whether you have earned £2 (two pounds) or £20 (twenty pounds) or some amount in between depends on how many pots you emptied in the first stage of the workshop.

Now I am going to explain the second stage of the workshop and you will see how the second part of your earnings from the first stage come into it.

Please listen carefully as these instructions are very important.

In a few minutes we are going to hand each of you a tray separated into four identically sized compartments. There will be several counters in each compartment. You will find a photo of a tray stuck on the right-hand wall of your work station. The little black round things to the right of the tray in the photo are counters. Each compartment on the tray relates to one of the people in this workshop and each counter is worth £1 (one pound). So, if there are 6 counters in one of the compartments it means that the person to which that compartment relates is starting the second stage of the experiment with £6 (six pounds). At the end of the workshop, these counters will be exchanged for real money.

In this stage of the workshop you are all going to be placed in groups of 4. This is why the trays have 4 compartments - one compartment for each of the 4 people in a group. The blue compartment is your compartment. The counters in this blue compartment indicate the amount of money you are starting out with.
So, if you earned £8 over and above the £4 already set aside for you from the pot-emptying, then there will be 8 counters in the blue compartment.

The 3 cream compartments hold the counters that the other people in your group earned over and above the £4 already set aside for them.

You will never know who else is in your group - you will just know how much money they earned.

We are going to hand the trays out now so you can see how much money you and the other people in your group have at the start of this stage of the workshop. Each tray is covered by a lid - please only lift the lid when the tray is on your desk so that it cannot be seen by anyone else. It is important that each person keeps the contents of his or her tray private.

[Hand out the trays being careful to hand the right tray to the right participant. Meanwhile say...]

There are a total of 44 counters on each tray. Please do not remove any of the counters. It is very important that we get all the counters back. Also, please do not move the counters around until we tell you that you may do so. Please just have a look at the tray so you know how much money you have and everyone else in your group has at this point in the workshop.

Remember as you look at the tray, the person with the most counters in the group has the most money because they emptied the most pots. The person with the fewest counters has the least money because they did not empty as many pots as others.

Everyone should now have a tray and should know how much money they and the other people in their group have for the second stage. If anyone does not understand their tray, or has any other questions please raise your hand?

OK. In this stage, if you choose, you can change the amounts of money that you and the other members of your group are to take home at the end of the workshop by moving the counters around the tray. In other words, you can take one or more £1 counters away from some people, including yourself, and give those £1 counters to other people, including yourself.

You can move the counters between compartments any way you choose until you are satisfied with the way they are distributed across the compartments. However, you are not allowed to take any counters completely off the tray. There are 44 counters on the trays now and all 44 counters need to be on the trays when they are returned to us.

Let me repeat this as it is important. You can move the counters between compartments any way you choose until you are satisfied with the way they are distributed across the compartments. However, you are not allowed to take any counters completely off the tray. There are 44 counters on the trays now and all 44 counters need to be on the trays when they are returned to us.

Before you start moving the counters on your tray there is another important thing I need to mention. In each group of four, only 1 person’s decision about how to distribute the counters across compartments is going to be carried out. For each group, we will put the four tray numbers in this/a cup and pick one at random. The money you receive at the end of the workshop, on top of the £4 already put aside, will
depend on the decision made by the person whose tray number is picked. Every person's decision has an equal chance of being the one that is carried out, so it is important that you think about your decision very carefully.

Finally, all the decisions you make will be kept secret – no-one else will ever know whether you were in their group or whether you moved money to them or away from them.

Remember that your compartment on the tray is blue.

If you do not understand what you are being asked to do or how it might affect yourself and others, or if you have any other questions, please raise your hand and we will come to you.

You may now make your decisions about whether and where to move counters. You can have as much time as you want. When you have arranged the counters as you see fit please close the lid of your tray and put up your hand. One of us will then collect your tray from you.

[When all trays collected...] One of my assistants will now come and give you a short questionnaire that we would like you to fill out. This questionnaire-filling is the third stage of the workshop and when it is finished you will be paid and will be free to leave. When you have finished filling in the questionnaire, raise your hand again. Please note that the questionnaire is on both sides of the paper.

[Hand out and later collect questionnaires. Calculate pay with reference to notes in next section of this document. Draw up receipts.]

We are now finished. Thank you for being so patient and thank you for participating in this workshop. We have worked out how much money each of you is to be paid. In a minute I will ask you to come to the desk just outside this door to receive and sign for your money. Then you will be free to leave.
Script for DJ Experiments
Oxford

UNEARNED – FILLING

[Before entering the lab subjects need to select a participant letter at random and be asked to sit at the desk bearing their participant letter. Record participant letters on the session form. Say to each...] Please keep this identification with you throughout the workshop. You will need it at the end to claim your payment.

[Once everyone is seated...] Thank you for coming here today and agreeing to take part in this workshop. We are now ready to begin so please could you all listen carefully to the instructions.

While the workshop is going on, please do not talk to anyone apart from me and my assistants. If you have any questions, please raise your hand and one of us will come to your desk and answer your question. If you talk to the people around you, you will be asked to leave.

There are three stages to the workshop. I am now going to explain what we want you to do in the first stage but please do not start the task until you are told to do so.

You are going to spend 7 minutes helping us sort out some materials that are to be used in a workshop sometime in the next day or so.

Each one of you will find a box of gravel and some small plastic pots on your desk. We would like you to put 7 pieces of blue gravel and 7 pieces of yellow gravel in each pot, making a total of 14 pieces of gravel in each one. Please be careful when counting the gravel. We will be running checks on the pots you fill and will have to discard any pots that do not have 7 pieces of blue gravel and 7 pieces of yellow gravel in. Also, make sure that the pot lids are closed properly once you have put the gravel in. We are not asking you to do this for free. You will be paid for helping us in this way.

Finally, if you are running out of pots or gravel please raise your hand and one of my assistants will bring you more.

Does anyone have any questions?

[Wait... answer as required...] Please now start filling pots. I will tell you when the 7 (seven) minutes is up. [Note start time]

[After 7 minutes have passed ...] Please can everyone stop now, the 7 minutes have finished. Thank you very much for your hard work. We will now come around and collect the trays, pots and gravel.

We now need to check that the counting has been done correctly and then set up the next stage of the experiment. This will take a few minutes. Please be patient and do not talk. I will explain the next stage of the workshop once we are ready.

[Count up and record the number of pots filled, disregarding any pots that clearly do not contain 7-7. Then, allocate each subject a tray by pulling participant letters out of one cup and tray numbers out of]
another. Record the participant-tray number matches on the session form. Also write the participant/desk letters on the tray lids and the corresponding receipts. While this is going on, the experimenter should read on.]

Alright, we are nearly ready to continue with the workshop. Thank you once again for the effort you put into filling the pots.

As promised, you will be paid for this. £4 has been set aside for each of you. You will receive this at the end of the experiment.

Now I am going to explain the second stage of the workshop.

Please listen carefully as these instructions are very important.

In this stage, you are each going to start off with a certain amount of money. My assistants are randomly determining how much money each one of you is going to start off with by pulling letters and numbers out of cups in a room down the corridor.

Right! In a few minutes we are going to hand each of you a tray separated into four identically sized compartments. There will be several counters in each compartment. You will find a photo of a tray stuck on the right-hand wall of your work station. The little black round things to the right of the tray in the photo are counters. Each compartment on the tray relates to one of the people in this workshop and each counter is worth £1 (one pound). So, if there are 6 counters in one of the compartments it means that the person to which that compartment relates is starting the second stage of the experiment with £6 (six pounds). At the end of the workshop, these counters will be exchanged for real money.

In this stage of the workshop you are all going to be placed in groups of 4. This is why the trays have 4 compartments - one compartment for each of the 4 people in a group. The blue compartment is your compartment. The counters in this blue compartment indicate the amount of money you are starting out with.

So, if you are starting this stage with £8, there will be 8 counters in the blue compartment.

The 3 cream compartments hold the counters that the other people in your group are starting this stage with.

You will never know who else is in your group - you will just know how much money they are starting out with.

We are going to hand the trays out now so you can see how much money you and the other people in your group have at the start of this stage of the workshop. Each tray is covered by a lid - please only lift the lid when the tray is on your desk so that it cannot be seen by anyone else. It is important that each person keeps the contents of his or her tray private.

[Hand out the trays being careful to hand the right tray to the right participant. Meanwhile say...]
There are a total of 44 counters on each tray. Please do not remove any of the counters. It is very important that we get all the counters back. Also, please do not move the counters around until we tell you that you may do so. Please just have a look at the tray so you know how much money you have and everyone else in your group has at this point in the workshop.

Remember as you look at the tray, the person with the most counters in the group has the most money. The person with the fewest counters has the least money at this point in the workshop.

Everyone should now have a tray and should know how much money they and the other people in their group have for the second stage. If anyone does not understand their tray, or has any other questions please raise your hand?

OK. In this stage, if you choose, you can change the amounts of money that you and the other members of your group are to take home at the end of the workshop by moving the counters around the tray. In other words, you can take one or more £1 counters away from some people, including yourself, and give those £1 counters to other people, including yourself.

You can move the counters between compartments **any way you choose** until you are satisfied with the way they are distributed across the compartments. However, you are not allowed to take any counters completely off the tray. There are 44 counters on the trays now and all 44 counters need to be on the trays when they are returned to us.

Let me repeat that as it is important. You can move the counters between compartments **any way you choose** until you are satisfied with the way they are distributed across the compartments. However, you are not allowed to take any counters completely off the tray. There are 44 counters on the trays now and all 44 counters need to be on the trays when they are returned to us.

Before you start moving the counters on your tray there is another important thing I need to mention. In each group of four, only 1 person’s decision about how to distribute the counters across compartments is going to be carried out. For each group, we will put the four tray numbers in this/a cup and pick one at random. The money you receive at the end of the workshop, on top of the £4 already put aside, will depend on the decision made by the person whose tray number is picked. Every person's decision has an equal chance of being the one that is carried out, so it is important that you think about your decision very carefully.

Finally, all the decisions you make will be kept secret – no-one else will ever know whether you were in their group or whether you moved money to them or away from them.

Remember that your compartment on the tray is blue.

If you do not understand what you are being asked to do or how it might affect yourself and others, or if you have any other questions, please raise your hand and we will come to you.

You may now make your decisions about whether and where to move counters. You can have as much time as you want. When you have arranged the counters as you see fit please close the lid of your tray and put up your hand. One of us will then collect your tray from you.
When all trays collected...] One of my assistants will now come and give you a short questionnaire that we would like you to fill out. This questionnaire-filling is the third stage of the workshop and when it is finished you will be paid and will be free to leave. When you have finished filling in the questionnaire, raise your hand again. Please note that the questionnaire is on both sides of the paper. 

[Hand out and later collect questionnaires. Calculate pay with reference to notes in next section of this document. Draw up receipts.] 

We are now finished. Thank you for being so patient and thank you for participating in this workshop. We have worked out how much money each of you is to be paid. In a minute I will ask you to come to the desk just outside this door to receive and sign for your money. Then you will be free to leave.
Script for DJ Experiments

Oxford

UNEARNED – EMPTYING

[Before entering the lab subjects need to select a participant letter at random and be asked to sit at the desk bearing their participant letter. Record participant letters on the session form. Say to each...] Please keep this identification with you throughout the workshop. You will need it at the end to claim your payment.

[Once everyone is seated...] Thank you for coming here today and agreeing to take part in this workshop. We are now ready to begin so please could you all listen carefully to the instructions.

While the workshop is going on, please do not talk to anyone apart from me and my assistants. If you have any questions, please raise your hand and one of us will come to your desk and answer your question. If you talk to the people around you, you will be asked to leave.

There are three stages to the workshop. I am now going to explain what we want you to do in the first stage but please do not start the task until you are told to do so.

You are going to spend 7 minutes helping us sort out some materials that are to be used in a workshop sometime in the next day or so.

Each one of you will find a pile of small plastic pots containing blue and yellow gravel and two larger containers. We would like you to empty the small pots and sort the gravel by colour, putting the blue gravel in one of the larger containers and the yellow gravel in the other. Open only one or two small pots at a time to ensure that, at the end of the 7 minutes, all of the gravel that is NOT in small pots is sorted into the larger containers. Also, be gentle with the small pots - the lids are on hinges, please don’t break the hinges. We are not asking you to do this for free. You will be paid for helping us in this way.

Finally, if you are running out of pots please raise your hand and one of my assistants will bring you more.

Does anyone have any questions?

[Wait... answer as required...] Please now start emptying pots. I will tell you when the 7 (seven) minutes is up. [Note start time]

[After 7 minutes have passed ...] Please can everyone stop now, the 7 minutes have finished. Thank you very much for your hard work. We will now come around and collect the trays, pots and gravel.

We now need to check that the sorting has been done correctly and then set up the next stage of the experiment. This will take a few minutes. Please be patient and do not talk. I will explain the next stage of the workshop once we are ready.

[Count up and record the number of pots sorted, disregarding any pots from which the gravel has been left unsorted. Then, allocate each subject a tray by pulling participant letters out of one cup and tray numbers...]

49
out of another. Record the participant letter/tray number matches on the session form. Also write the participant/desk letters on the tray lids and the corresponding receipts. While this is going on, the experimenter should read on.]

Alright, we are nearly ready to continue with the workshop. Thank you once again for the effort you put into emptying the pots.

As promised, you will be paid for this. £4 has been set aside for each of you. You will receive this at the end of the experiment.

Now I am going to explain the second stage of the workshop.

Please listen carefully as these instructions are very important.

In this stage, you are each going to start off with a certain amount of money. My assistants are randomly determining how much money each one of you is going to start off with by pulling letters and numbers out of cups in a room down the corridor.

Right! In a few minutes we are going to hand each of you a tray separated into four identically sized compartments. There will be several counters in each compartment. You will find a photo of the tray stuck on the right-hand wall of your work station. The little black round things to the right of the tray in the photo are counters. Each compartment on the tray relates to one of the people in this workshop and each counter is worth £1 (one pound). So, if there are 6 counters in one of the compartments it means that the person to which that compartment relates is starting the second stage of the experiment with £6 (six pounds). At the end of the workshop, these counters will be exchanged for real money.

In this stage of the workshop you are all going to be placed in groups of 4. This is why the trays have 4 compartments - one compartment for each of the 4 people in a group. The blue compartment is your compartment. The counters in this blue compartment indicate the amount of money you are starting out with.

So, if you are starting this stage with £8, there will be 8 counters in the blue compartment.

The 3 cream compartments hold the counters that the other people in your group are starting this stage with.

You will never know who else is in your group - you will just know how much money they are starting out with.

We are going to hand the trays out now so you can see how much money you and the other people in your group have at the start of this stage of the workshop. Each tray is covered by a lid - please only lift the lid when the tray is on your desk so that it cannot be seen by anyone else. It is important that each person keeps the contents of his or her tray private.

[Hand out the trays being careful to hand the right tray to the right participant. Meanwhile say...]
There are a total of 44 counters on each tray. Please do not remove any of the counters. It is very important that we get all the counters back. Also, please do not move the counters around until we tell you that you may do so. Please just have a look at the tray so you know how much money you have and everyone else in your group has at this point in the workshop.

Remember as you look at the tray, the person with the most counters in the group has the most money. The person with the fewest counters has the least money at this point in the workshop.

Everyone should now have a tray and should know how much money they and the other people in their group have for the second stage. If anyone does not understand their tray, or has any other questions please raise your hand?

OK. In this stage, if you choose, you can change the amounts of money that you and the other members of your group are to take home at the end of the workshop by moving the counters around the tray. In other words, you can take one or more £1 counters away from some people, including yourself, and give those £1 counters to other people, including yourself.

You can move the counters between compartments **any way you choose** until you are satisfied with the way they are distributed across the compartments. **However**, you are not allowed to take any counters completely off the tray. There are 44 counters on the trays now and all 44 counters need to be on the trays when they are returned to us.

Let me repeat that as it is important. You can move the counters between compartments **any way you choose** until you are satisfied with the way they are distributed across the compartments. **However**, you are not allowed to take any counters completely off the tray. There are 44 counters on the trays now and all 44 counters need to be on the trays when they are returned to us.

Before you start moving the counters on your tray there is another important thing I need to mention. In each group of four, only 1 person’s decision about how to distribute the counters across compartments is going to be carried out. For each group, we will put the four tray numbers in this/a cup and pick one at random. The money you receive at the end of the workshop, on top of the £4 already put aside, will depend on the decision made by the person whose tray number is picked. Every person’s decision has an equal chance of being the one that is carried out, so it is important that you think about your decision very carefully.

Finally, all the decisions you make will be kept secret – no-one else will ever know whether you were in their group or whether you moved money to them or away from them.

Remember that your compartment on the tray is blue.

If you do not understand what you are being asked to do or how it might affect yourself and others, or if you have any other questions, please raise your hand and we will come to you.

You may now make your decisions about whether and where to move counters. You can have as much time as you want. When you have arranged the counters as you see fit please close the lid of your tray and put up your hand. One of us will then collect your tray from you.
[When all trays collected...] One of my assistants will now come and give you a short questionnaire that we would like you to fill out. This questionnaire-filling is the third stage of the workshop and when it is finished you will be paid and will be free to leave. When you have finished filling in the questionnaire, raise your hand again. Please note that the questionnaire is on both sides of the paper.

[Hand out and later collect questionnaires. Calculate pay with reference to notes in next section of this document. Draw up receipts.]

We are now finished. Thank you for being so patient and thank you for participating in this workshop. We have worked out how much money each of you is to be paid. In a minute I will ask you to come to the desk just outside this door to receive and sign for your money. Then you will be free to leave.
1. Today’s date (dd/mm/yy): 06/12/2010 Start time of session: 15:30
2. Your letter id for the session:
3. Date of birth (dd/mm/yyyy):
4. Male or female: Male [ ] Female [ ]
5. Nationality:
6. Please select the option that best describes your religion and religious practice?
   - Christian, Protestant, practicing
   - Christian, Catholic, practicing
   - Christian, other (specify below), practicing
   - Muslim, practicing
   - Hindu, practicing
   - Sikh, practicing
   - Jewish, practicing
   - Atheist
   - Other please specify below
   - Christian, Protestant, not practicing
   - Christian, Catholic, not practicing
   - Christian, other (specify below), not practicing
   - Muslim, not practicing
   - Hindu, not practicing
   - Sikh, not practicing
   - Jewish, not practicing
   - Agnostic
7. Which of the following qualifications have you obtained thus far?
   - GCSEs
   - GCE O Levels
   - A/S Levels
   - GCE A Level
   - Diploma of Higher Education
   - Higher National Diploma
   - Scottish School Cert, Higher School Cert or Scottish School Qual.
   - Scottish School Cert, Higher School Cert or Scottish School Qual.
   - Other (please specify below)
8. Please select the option that best describes your current situation?
   - Full-time student at school/college/university
   - Self employed
   - Unemployed
   - Retired from paid work altogether
   - Unemployed and on a training scheme
   - On maternity leave
   - On an employment scheme and drawing benefits
   - Looking after family or home
   - In paid employment (full- or part-time)
   - Long-term sick or disabled
   - Other please specify below
9. If you are a full-time student, please write the name of your school, college, or university below


10. If you are a full-time student, when was the last time you were either in paid employment or unemployed and claiming benefits?

   Last time in paid employment (mm/yyyy):

   Last time unemployed and claiming (mm/yyyy):

11. If you are currently unemployed and/or drawing benefits, when was the last time you were either a full-time student or in paid employment?

   Last time a full time student (mm/yyyy):

   Last time in paid employment (mm/yyyy):

12. If you are currently unemployed and/or drawing benefits, are you now or have you recently (last 6 months) received any training designed to help you gain employment?

   yes  
   no  (skip forward to 15)

13. If that training is now finished, when was the last time you received any such training?

   (mm/yyyy):

14. Please write the name of the organization that is providing (or provided) that training below (e.g., Cherwell College, Scout Enterprises,...)


15. If you are currently employed, when was the last time you were either a full-time student or unemployed?

   Last time a full time student (mm/yyyy):

   Last time unemployed (mm/yyyy):

16. Irrespective of your current situation, are you currently receiving Job seekers' allowance or any other form of income support?

   Job seekers' allowance  
   Income support  
   none

17. Irrespective of your current situation, have you been unemployed at any time during the past 3 years, i.e., since early December 2007? (students should not count winter/spring/summer holidays unless they claimed benefits)

   yes  
   no  (skip forward to 19)

18. For how many months in total were you unemployed during the past 3 years?

19. Irrespective of your current situation, have you received Job seekers' allowance or any other form of income support during the past 3 years, i.e., since early December 2007?

   Job seekers' allowance  
   Income support  
   none
SESSION DATA FORM FOR DJ EXPERIMENT

Date: 
Time:  

Treatment:  
Earned  
Unearned  

Task: 
Pot filling  
Pot emptying  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject id (A - P)</th>
<th>No. pots filled/emptied</th>
<th>Cheated during task (emptying only)</th>
<th>Rank (earned only)</th>
<th>Tray number</th>
<th>Selected to determine payoffs, yes=1, no=0</th>
<th>Number of counters left in...</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>blue section</td>
<td>left section</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>J</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>K</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>O</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Protocols for DJ Experiments
To be conducted in the Cape Town area, 2011

Introduction

This document contains the protocols for the DJ experiments to be run in the Cape Town area in 2011.

Throughout the document, two types of tray are referred to: “real effort task trays” and “decision trays”. There are 16 of each. The former are grey and are each labeled with a letter (A to P). They hold yellow and blue gravel one or two (depending on the real effort task being applied) rectangular containers and lots of small plastic pots (see Photo 1). The latter are cream and have lids. Each is labeled with a number (1 to 16) (see Photo 2).

It is important that when the trays are being handed out to subjects and collected back in care is taken not to dislodge or drop the contents of the trays. It is the contents of the trays and the way they are arranged on the trays that constitutes our data.

Venues

The venues need to contain 16 desks / workstations and chairs for the subjects. There also needs to be another large table on which the researchers and RAs can evaluate the real effort trays, set up the decision trays, and record the data on returned decision trays. Ideally, this large table would be in an adjacent room. One further table at the entrance of the venue would be useful, although not essential. Chairs for the researchers and RAs would be nice, but not essential (we could take folding chairs perhaps).

Preparation of materials

Here is the list of materials that need to be prepared before each session

1. 1 set of letter labels, bearing letters A to P, one to be stuck in each subject’s cubicle or desk;
2. Blue tack or double-sided sticky tape;
3. 16 copies of Photo 1, decision tray and counters, (also to be stuck in cubicles or on desks);
4. Laminated letters (A to P)
5. Red cup labeled “Letters A to P” containing letters (A to P) on small folded pieces of paper
6. Four yellow cups labeled “Group 1”, “Group 2”, “Group 3”, and “Group 4” each containing four small folded pieces of paper each with a number on it, numbers should be distributed as follows:
7. 1 session form
8. Post-it notes (16) each with a letter on it, A to P; these are to be stuck on decision tray lids when they have been allocated to subjects (more on this below);
9. 16 questionnaires prepared as indicated below;
10. 16 real effort task trays set up as indicated below;
11. 16 decision trays set up as indicated below;
12. 16 privacy screens (if session not to be run in a dedicated experimental lab).

**Things to do before each session**

1. If the venue is not a dedicated experimental lab, a privacy screen needs to be set up on each desk.
2. One letter label (A to P) needs to be stuck each cubicle / desk / privacy screen and a map drawn to be used when directing subjects to their desks;
3. A copy of Photo 1 of a decision tray with 44 counters lying beside it needs to be stuck on each cubicle / desk / privacy screen;
4. The real effort task trays need to be set up in accordance with the session type:
   i. For filling sessions there need to be 30 empty small plastic pots on the tray along with a container of mixed yellow and blue gravel (see photo);
   ii. For emptying sessions there need to be 50 filled small plastic pots on the tray along with two empty rectangular containers (photo to come);
5. One real effort task tray should be placed on each desk / in each cubicle / privacy screen. The letter on the tray must match the letter on the desk / cubicle / privacy screen;
6. Extra real effort task materials may have to be distributed to subjects who are fast:
i. For the filling task, this is the bag of spare empty pots and a tray of mixed gravel
ii. For the emptying task, this is the bag of spare full pots;

7. The decision trays need to be set up in accordance with Figure 1 (this must be done with care);

8. The decision trays should be laid out (1 to 16) on a table some way away from the subjects’
desks / cubicles.

5. Laminated letters (A to P) need to be put face down on table at entrance to the venue. (Each
subject selects one on arrival, they sit at the desk / cubicle / privacy screen bearing the same
letter and keep the letter until the end of the session when the letters are used to identify the
subjects for payment);

6. A session form needs to be started. Date, time, treatment, and task need to be recorded. Note
that the subjects’ letters (A to P) are already listed in the left-hand column of the form. These
letters are the subjects’ ids and their physical addresses, i.e., their desk / cubicle ids, for the
session. All of the other data entered onto this form needs to be matched to these letters;

8. The date and time of the session needs to be entered on each of the 16 questionnaires. A letter
(A to P) should be written in the “Your letter id for the session” box.

**Tasks to be performed by experimental team during the session**

1. On arrival, the subjects should be asked to pick a letter from the table near the lab entrance.
   They should then be directed to the desk / cubicle bearing the same letter and told to keep the
   letter until the end of the session when they are paid.

2. When the person reading the session script tells the subjects to stop filling/emptying pots, the
   real effort task trays need to be collected and taken to the large table. Before they are collected
   the RAs should get the subjects to put all of the materials back on the trays.

3. In earned treatment sessions,
   i. the filled/emptied pots on each real effort task tray need to be counted and the count
      recorded next to the subjects’ id letter on the session form
   ii. the pot counts need to be translated into performance ranks (1 for most, 16 for least)
   iii. then, using Table 1 (below), the decision trays should be assigned to subjects with
        reference to their performance rank
   iv. the number of the decision tray being assigned to each subject needs to be recorded
        on the session form and in the “payoff calculator spreadsheet” being careful to put
        the correct tray number next to each subjects’ letter
   v. then, each decision tray needs to be labeled with a post-it note bearing the letter of
      the receiving subject
   vi. once the decision trays have been labeled with letter-bearing post-it notes, they can
       be sorted into piles (one for each line of cubicles / desks / privacy screens ready for
       handing out
4. In unearned treatment sessions,
   i. the filled/emptied pots on each tray do not need to be counted until the end of the
      session or when there is a quiet moment
   ii. which subject gets which decision tray is randomly determined by picking letters the
      two red cup
   iii. one tray is selected (in order) one letter is drawn
   iv. the post-it note bearing the drawn letter is put on the selected decision tray (so this
      decision tray is to be delivered to the subject with this letter)
   v. 16 tray-selection-letter-draws are made.
   vi. the drawn letters are not put back in the cups until all 16 decision trays have been
       assigned
   vii. while the assigning is ongoing, the letters set aside in a pile. Once all the draws have
       been made the letters are refolded and put in the red cup.
   viii. the number of the tray being assigned to each subject needs to be recorded on the
       session form and in the “payoff calculator spreadsheet” being careful to put the right
       tray number next to each subjects’ letter
   ix. Then, the decision trays need to be labeled with post-it notes bearing the letter of the
       receiving subjects.
   x. once the decision trays have been labeled with letter-bearing post-it notes, they can
      be sorted into piles (one for each line of cubicles / desks / privacy screens ready for
      handing out

5. When the person reading the session script says so, the decision trays can be delivered to the
   desks / cubicles, taking care to match the letter on the post-it note to the letter on the cubicle.

6. When people raise their hands indicating that they have finished making their decisions, the
   decision trays can be collected back in and taken to the large table

7. Once all the decision trays are in, the RAs can set about interviewing the subjects and filling out
   the questionnaires

8. To determine earnings, one decision tray number has to be randomly picked from each “Group
   cup” (the yellow cups). I recommend: taking one cup from the set of four; making a random
   draw from that one cup; recording the number drawn on the session form by placing a “1” next
   to the picked tray number in the appropriate column; refolding the number and putting it back in
   the cup; putting that cup to one side (not back with the others); taking another cup and
   repeating; taking another cup and repeating; and then taking the last cup and repeating. This
   approach will minimize human error (e.g., drawing two numbers from the same cup) and will
   ensure that all the numbers are in the right cups ready for the next session.

9. The picked decision tray numbers indicated on the session form also need to be indicated in the
   same way in the “payoff calculator spreadsheet”.

10. The picked decision trays need to be separated from the rest and the counters in each of the
    segments counted up and entered into the appropriate row and in the “payoff calculator
    spreadsheet”. Do not rearrange the counters at this stage.
11. Enter the numbers of counters in each segment (blue left, top, right) on these 4 decision trays into the payoff calculator spreadsheet (in the appropriate rows)

12. The spreadsheet will return the payoffs for all subjects (if the payoff calculator fails in some way, Table 2 below can be used to calculate the payoffs manually)

13. Save the spreadsheet using a new name indicating the date and time of the session (the rest of the data will be filled in after the session)

14. The payoffs should then be transcribed onto receipts, adding the show-up fee.

15. Make sure session form is complete and clear.

16. Staple the session form and the questionnaires together.

17. Prepare for next session
Figure 1: Set up of the 16 trays for each session

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tray 1</th>
<th>Tray 2</th>
<th>Tray 3</th>
<th>Tray 4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tray 5</th>
<th>Tray 6</th>
<th>Tray 7</th>
<th>Tray 8</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tray 9</th>
<th>Tray 10</th>
<th>Tray 11</th>
<th>Tray 12</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tray 13</th>
<th>Tray 14</th>
<th>Tray 15</th>
<th>Tray 16</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 1: Assigning decision trays according to performance in real effort task

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject rank for task performance</th>
<th>Tray number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>most pots =</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>fewest pots=</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 2: Payment allocations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group 1</th>
<th>If Tray 1 is picked</th>
<th>If Tray 3 is picked</th>
<th>If Tray 10 is picked</th>
<th>If Tray 12 is picked</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Subject who played with Tray 1 gets value of counters in</td>
<td>blue quadrant</td>
<td>opposite quadrant</td>
<td>righthand quadrant</td>
<td>lefthand quadrant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject who played with Tray 3 gets value of counters in</td>
<td>opposite quadrant</td>
<td>blue quadrant</td>
<td>lefthand quadrant</td>
<td>righthand quadrant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject who played with Tray 10 gets value of counters in</td>
<td>righthand quadrant</td>
<td>lefthand quadrant</td>
<td>blue quadrant</td>
<td>opposite quadrant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject who played with Tray 12 gets value of counters in</td>
<td>lefthand quadrant</td>
<td>righthand quadrant</td>
<td>opposite quadrant</td>
<td>blue quadrant</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group 2</th>
<th>If Tray 5 is picked</th>
<th>If Tray 7 is picked</th>
<th>If Tray 14 is picked</th>
<th>If Tray 16 is picked</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Subject who played with Tray 5 gets value of counters in</td>
<td>blue quadrant</td>
<td>opposite quadrant</td>
<td>righthand quadrant</td>
<td>lefthand quadrant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject who played with Tray 7 gets value of counters in</td>
<td>opposite quadrant</td>
<td>blue quadrant</td>
<td>lefthand quadrant</td>
<td>righthand quadrant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject who played with Tray 14 gets value of counters in</td>
<td>righthand quadrant</td>
<td>lefthand quadrant</td>
<td>blue quadrant</td>
<td>opposite quadrant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject who played with Tray 16 gets value of counters in</td>
<td>lefthand quadrant</td>
<td>righthand quadrant</td>
<td>opposite quadrant</td>
<td>blue quadrant</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group 3</th>
<th>If Tray 2 is picked</th>
<th>If Tray 4 is picked</th>
<th>If Tray 9 is picked</th>
<th>If Tray 11 is picked</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Subject who played with Tray 2 gets value of counters in</td>
<td>blue quadrant</td>
<td>opposite quadrant</td>
<td>righthand quadrant</td>
<td>lefthand quadrant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject who played with Tray 4 gets value of counters in</td>
<td>opposite quadrant</td>
<td>blue quadrant</td>
<td>lefthand quadrant</td>
<td>righthand quadrant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject who played with Tray 9 gets value of counters in</td>
<td>righthand quadrant</td>
<td>lefthand quadrant</td>
<td>blue quadrant</td>
<td>opposite quadrant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject who played with Tray 11 gets value of counters in</td>
<td>lefthand quadrant</td>
<td>righthand quadrant</td>
<td>opposite quadrant</td>
<td>blue quadrant</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group 4</th>
<th>If Tray 6 is picked</th>
<th>If Tray 8 is picked</th>
<th>If Tray 13 is picked</th>
<th>If Tray 15 is picked</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Subject who played with Tray 6 gets value of counters in</td>
<td>blue quadrant</td>
<td>opposite quadrant</td>
<td>righthand quadrant</td>
<td>lefthand quadrant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject who played with Tray 8 gets value of counters in</td>
<td>opposite quadrant</td>
<td>blue quadrant</td>
<td>lefthand quadrant</td>
<td>righthand quadrant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject who played with Tray 13 gets value of counters in</td>
<td>righthand quadrant</td>
<td>lefthand quadrant</td>
<td>blue quadrant</td>
<td>opposite quadrant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject who played with Tray 15 gets value of counters in</td>
<td>lefthand quadrant</td>
<td>righthand quadrant</td>
<td>opposite quadrant</td>
<td>blue quadrant</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Photo 1: Real Effort Task Tray for pot-filling sessions

Photo 2: Real Effort Task Tray for pot-emptying sessions
Photo 3: Decision Tray
[Before entering the lab subjects need to select a participant letter at random and be asked to sit at the desk bearing their participant letter. Record participant letters on the session form. Once everyone is seated...]

Thank you for coming here today and for agreeing to take part in this workshop.

When you came in today, you each chose a letter.

This is your player identification letter.

Please keep this player identification letter with you. You will need it at the end of the session to claim your money.

Does everyone understand?

We are now ready to begin so please could you all listen carefully to the instructions.

While the workshop is going on, please do not talk to anyone other than me and my assistants.

If you have any questions, please raise your hand and one of us will come to your desk and answer your question. If you talk to the people around you, you will be asked to leave.

There are three parts to the workshop. I am now going to explain what we want you to do in the first part but please do not start the task until you are told to do so.

You are going to spend 7 minutes helping us sort out some materials that are to be used in another workshop later today, or tomorrow.

We are not asking you to do this for free. You will be paid for helping us in this way.

On your desk, you will find a box of gravel and some small plastic pots.

Please put 7 pieces of blue gravel and 7 pieces of yellow gravel in each pot.

Please be careful when counting the gravel. There should be 14 pieces of gravel in total in each pot, 7 blue and 7 yellow... like this one [show example].

Once you have filled a pot, make sure that the pot lid is closed properly.

We will check the pots that you fill.

The more pots you fill, the more money you will have at the end of this task. You will use this money in the second part of this workshop.
However, any pots that do not have 7 pieces of blue gravel and 7 pieces of yellow gravel in will not be counted.

The people who fill the most pots will start the second part of the workshop with a lot more money than the people who fill the fewest.

If you are running out of pots or gravel please raise your hand and one of us will bring you more.

Does anyone have any questions?

[Wait... answer as required...] Please now start filling pots. I will tell you when the 7 (seven) minutes is up.  
[Note start time]

[AFTER 7 minutes have passed ...] Please can everyone stop now, the 7 minutes have finished. Please raise both hands in the air and keep them there until one of us comes to you. Thank you very much for your hard work. We will now come around and collect the trays, pots and gravel.

We will check that each pot has 7 pieces of blue gravel and 7 pieces of yellow gravel, write down the number of pots each one of you has filled and then begin the next part of the workshop. This will take a few minutes. Please be patient and do not talk. I will explain the next part of the workshop once we are ready.

[Rank the subjects according to how many small pots they filled. Disregard pots that clearly do not contain 7+7. Record the number of pots and their rank on the session form. Then, allocate trays to subjects according to Table 1 (which links ranks to tray numbers) at the end of this document. Record their tray numbers on the session form. Also write the participant/desk letters on the tray lids and the corresponding receipts.]

Alright, we are nearly ready to continue with the workshop. Thank you once again for the effort you put into filling the pots.

As promised, you will be paid for this. There are two parts to your pay:

First, 28 Rand has been set aside for each of you. You will receive this at the end of the workshop.

Second, each of you has earned additional money for the second part of the workshop depending on how many pots you filled. You will have earned anywhere between an extra R14 and R140.

Now I am going to explain the second part of the workshop to you.

Please listen carefully as these instructions are very important, and, once again, please to not start the task until you are told to do so.

In this part of the workshop you are all going to be placed in groups of 4. However, you will never know who else is in your group.
[hold up tray photo...] In a few minutes we are going to hand each of you a tray, like the one in this photo. You will find a copy of this photo to your right.

Each tray has 4 triangles – one triangle for each person in your group. The blue triangle is your triangle. The 3 cream triangles are for the other 3 people in your group.

[hold up counter...] On each tray there will be several counters, like this one, in each triangle. In the photo, the little black round things to the right of the tray are counters.

Each of you has earned counters based on the number of pots you filled in the first part of the workshop.

Each counter is worth R7. So 6 counters in a triangle is worth R42, 3 counters is worth R21, 10 counters is worth R70, and so on.

The counters in the blue triangle show the amount of money you are starting the second part of the workshop with.

The counters in the other 3 cream triangles show the amount of money that the other people in your group are starting the second part of the workshop with.

You will never know who else is in your group, you will just know how much money they earned by looking at the number of counters in their triangles.

At the end of the workshop, these counters will be changed for real money.

We are going to hand the trays out now so you can see how much money you and the other people in your group have at the start of this part of the workshop. Each tray is covered by a lid - please only lift the lid when the tray is on your desk so that it cannot be seen by anyone else. It is important that each person keeps the contents of his or her tray private. [Hand out the trays being careful to hand the right tray to the right participant. Meanwhile say...]

There are a total of 44 counters on each tray. Please do not take any counters away with you. It is very important that we get all the counters back. Please just have a look at the tray so you know how much money you have, and everyone else in your group has, at this point in the workshop.

Remember as you look at the tray, the person with the most counters in the group has the most money because they filled the most pots. The person with the fewest counters has the least money because they didn't fill as many pots as others.

Everyone should now have a tray and should know how much money they and the other people in their group have at the start of the second part of the workshop.

If anyone does not understand their tray, or has any other questions please raise your hand.

OK. In this part of the workshop, if you choose, you can change the amounts of money that you and the other members of your group are to take home at the end of the workshop by moving the counters around the tray.
In other words, you can take one or more counters away from some people, including yourself, and give those counters to other people, including yourself.

If you want, you can move the counters between the triangles any way you choose until you are happy with the number of counters in each triangle. However, you are not allowed to take any counters completely off the tray. There are 44 counters on the trays now and all 44 counters need to be on the trays when they are returned to us.

Let me repeat that, as it is important. If you want, you can move the counters between the triangles any way you choose until you are happy with the number of counters in each triangle. However, you are not allowed to take any counters completely off the tray. There are 44 counters on the trays now and all 44 counters need to be on the trays when they are returned to us.

Before you start moving the counters on your tray there is another important thing I need to say. Once everyone has made their choices about moving counters we will collect the trays. Then, for each group of four, we will put the four tray numbers into a cup and pick one at random. The money you receive at the end of the workshop, on top of the R28 already put aside, will depend on the decision made by the person in your group whose tray number is picked. Every person’s tray has an equal chance of being picked, so every person’s decision has an equal chance of being carried out. It is important that you think about your decision very carefully.

Finally, all the decisions you make will be kept secret. No-one else will ever know whether you were in their group or whether you moved money to them or away from them.

So, in summary:

- The blue triangle is your triangle
- The other triangles relate to 3 other people but you don't know who they are
- The counters are equivalent to money
- The number of counters in a triangle tells you how much that person earned
- You can move the counters on your tray any way you choose
- If and how you move them will never be known by anyone else
- Of the four people in your group, only one person's decision about final payments will be carried out

If you do not understand what you are being asked to do or how it might affect yourself and others, or if you have any other questions, please raise your hand and we will come to you.

You may now make your decisions about whether and where to move counters. You can have as much time as you want. When you have arranged the counters as you see fit please close the lid of your tray and put up your hand. One of us will then collect your tray from you.
[When all trays collected...] One of us will now come and give you a short questionnaire that we would like you to fill out. This questionnaire is the third part of the workshop. When this part of the workshop is finished you will be paid and will be free to leave. Please note that the questionnaire is on both sides of the pages. When you have finished filling out the questionnaire please raise your hand again.

[Hand out and later collect questionnaires. Calculate pay with reference to notes in next section of this document. Draw up receipts.]

We are now finished. Thank you for being so patient and thank you for participating in this workshop. We have worked out how much money each of you is to be paid. In a minute I will ask you, one by one, to come to the desk by the door to receive and sign for your money. Then you will be free to leave.
[Before entering the lab subjects need to select a participant letter at random and be asked to sit at the desk bearing their participant letter. Record participant letters on the session form. Once everyone is seated...]

Thank you for coming here today and for agreeing to take part in this workshop.

When you came in today, you each chose a letter.

This is your player identification letter.

Please keep this player identification letter with you. You will need it at the end of the session to claim your money.

Does everyone understand?

We are now ready to begin so please could you all listen carefully to the instructions.

While the workshop is going on, please do not talk to anyone other than me and my assistants.

If you have any questions, please raise your hand and one of us will come to your desk and answer your question. If you talk to the people around you, you will be asked to leave.

There are three parts to the workshop. I am now going to explain what we want you to do in the first part but please do not start the task until you are told to do so.

You are going to spend 7 minutes helping us sort out some materials that are to be used in a another workshop later today, or tomorrow.

We are not asking you to do this for free. You will be paid for helping us in this way.

[hold up example pot...] On your desk, you will find some small plastic pots containing blue and yellow gravel, like this one, and two larger containers.

Please empty the small pots, one or two at a time, and put the blue gravel in one of the larger containers and the yellow gravel in the other.

Also, please be gentle with the small pots and try not to break the hinges on the lids!

The more pots you empty, the more money you will have at the end of this task. You will use this money in the second part of the workshop.

Will will check and count the pots that you empty. However, any pots that have been emptied but the gravel has not been sorted into the larger containers, will not be counted.
The people who empty the most pots will start the second part of the workshop with a lot more money than the people who empty the fewest.

If you are running out of pots please raised your hand and one of us will bring you more.

Does anyone have any questions? [Wait... answer as required...]

Please now start emptying pots. I will tell you when the 7 (seven) minutes is up. [Note start time]

[After 7 minutes...] Please can everyone stop now. Please raise both hands in the air and keep them there until one of my assistants comes to you. Thank you very much for your hard work. We will now come around and collect the trays, pots and gravel.

We will record the number of pots that you have emptied, check that the sorting has been done correctly and then set up the next part of the workshop. This will take a few minutes. Please be patient and do not talk. I will explain the next part of the workshop once we are ready.

[Rank the subjects according to how many small pots they emptied. Disregard pots from which the gravel has been left unsorted. Record the number of sorted pots and their rank on the session form. Then, allocate trays to subjects according to Table 1 (which links ranks to tray numbers) at the end of this document. Record their tray numbers on the session form. Also write the participant/desk letters on the tray lids and the corresponding receipts.]

Alright, we are nearly ready to continue with the workshop. Thank you once again for the effort you put into emptying the pots.

As promised, you will be paid for this. There are two parts to your pay:

First, 28 Rand has been set aside for each of you. You will receive this at the end of the workshop.

Second, each of you has earned additional money for the next part of the workshop depending on how many pots you emptied. You will have earned anywhere between an extra R14 and R140.

Now I am going to explain the second stage of the workshop.

Please listen carefully as these instructions are very important, and, once again, please to not start the task until you are told to do so.

In this part of the workshop you are all going to be placed in groups of 4. However, you will never know who else is in your group.

[hold up tray photo...] In a few minutes we are going to hand each of you a tray, like the one in this photo. You will find a copy of this photo to your right.

Each tray has 4 triangles – one triangle for each person in your group. The blue triangle is your triangle. The 3 cream triangles are for the other 3 people in your group.

[hold up counter...] On each tray there will be several counters, like this one, in each triangle. In the photo, the little black round things to the right of the tray are counters.
Each of you has earned counters based on the number of pots you emptied in the first part of the workshop.

Each counter is worth R7. So 6 counters in a triangle is worth R42, 3 counters is worth R21, 10 counters is worth R70, and so on.

The counters in the blue triangle show the amount of money you are starting the second part of the workshop with.

The counters in the other 3 cream triangles show the amount of money that the other people in your group are starting the second part of the workshop with.

You will never know who else is in your group, you will just know how much money they earned by looking at the number of counters in their triangles.

At the end of the workshop, these counters will be changed for real money.

We are going to hand the trays out now so you can see how much money you and the other people in your group have at the start of this part of the workshop. Each tray is covered by a lid - please only lift the lid when the tray is on your desk so that it cannot be seen by anyone else. It is important that each person keeps the contents of his or her tray private.

[Hand out the trays being careful to hand the right tray to the right participant. Meanwhile say...]

There are a total of 44 counters on each tray. Please do not take any counters away with you. It is very important that we get all the counters back. Please just have a look at the tray so you know how much money you have and everyone else in your group has at this point in the workshop.

Remember as you look at the tray, the person with the most counters in the group has the most money because they emptied the most pots. The person with the fewest counters has the least money because they did not empty as many pots as others.

Everyone should now have a tray and should know how much money they and the other people in their group have for the second part on the workshop.

If anyone does not understand their tray, or has any other questions please raise your hand?

OK. In this stage, if you choose, you can change the amounts of money that you and the other members of your group are to take home at the end of the workshop by moving the counters around the tray.

In other words, you can take one or more counters away from some people, including yourself, and give those counters to other people, including yourself.

If you want, you can move the counters between the triangles any way you choose until you are happy with the number of counters in each triangle. However, you are not allowed to take any counters completely off the tray. There are 44 counters on the trays now and all 44 counters need to be on the trays when they are returned to us.
Let me repeat this as it is important. If you want, you can move the counters between the triangles any way you choose until you are happy with the number of counters in each triangle. However, you are not allowed to take any counters completely off the tray. There are 44 counters on the trays now and all 44 counters need to be on the trays when they are returned to us.

Before you start moving the counters on your tray there is another important thing I need to mention. Once everyone has made their choices we will collect the trays. Then, for each group of four, we will put the four tray numbers into a cup and pick one at random. The money you receive at the end of the workshop, on top of the R28 already put aside, will depend on the decision made by the person in your group whose number is picked. Every person’s tray has an equal chance of being picked, so every person’s decision has an equal chance of being carried out. It is important that you think about your decision very carefully.

Finally, all the decisions you make will be kept secret. No-one else will ever know whether you were in their group or whether you moved money to them or away from them.

So, in summary:

- The blue triangle is your triangle
- The other triangles relate to 3 other people but you don’t know who they are
- The counters are equivalent to money
- The number of counters in a triangle tells you how much that person earned
- You can move the counters on your tray any way you choose
- If and how you move them will never be known by anyone else
- Of the four people in your group, only one person’s decision about final payments will be carried out

If you do not understand what you are being asked to do or how it might affect yourself and others, or if you have any other questions, please raise your hand and we will come to you.

You may now make your decisions about whether and where to move counters. You can have as much time as you want. When you have arranged the counters as you see fit please close the lid of your tray and put up your hand. One of us will then collect your tray from you.

[When all trays collected...] One of us will now come and give you a short questionnaire that we would like you to fill out. This questionnaire is the third part of the workshop. When this part of the workshop it is finished you will be paid and will be free to leave. Please note that the questionnaire is on both sides of the pages. When you have finished filling out the questionnaire please raise your hand again.

[Hand out and later collect questionnaires. Calculate pay with reference to notes in next section of this document. Draw up receipts.]
We are now finished. Thank you for being so patient and thank you for participating in this workshop. We have worked out how much money each of you is to be paid. In a minute I will ask you to come, one by one, to the desk by the door to receive and sign for your money. Then you will be free to leave.
Script for DJ Experiments
Cape Town, May-June 2011

UNEARNED – FILLING

[Before entering the lab subjects need to select a participant letter at random and be asked to sit at the
desk bearing their participant letter. Record participant letters on the session form. Once everyone is
seated...]

Thank you for coming here today and agreeing to take part in this workshop.

When you came in today, you each chose a letter.

This is your player identification letter.

Please keep this player identification letter with you. You will need it at the end of the session to claim
your money.

Does everyone understand?

We are now ready to begin so please could you all listen carefully to the instructions.

While the workshop is going on, please do not talk to anyone apart from me and my assistants.

If you have any questions, please raise your hand and one of us will come to your desk and answer your
question. If you talk to the people around you, you will be asked to leave.

There are three parts to the workshop. I am now going to explain what we want you to do in the first part
but please do not start the task until you are told to do so.

You are going to spend 7 minutes helping us sort out some materials that are to be used in another
workshop later today, or tomorrow.

We are not asking you to do this for free. You will be paid for helping us in this way.

On your desk you will find a box of gravel and some small plastic pots on your desk.

Please put 7 pieces of blue gravel and 7 pieces of yellow gravel in each pot.

Please be careful when counting the gravel. There should be 14 pieces of gravel in total in each pot, 7 blue
and 7 yellow... like this one. [show example]

Once you have filled a pot, please make sure that the pot lid is closed properly.

We will check the pots that you fill.

If you are running out of pots or gravel please raise your hand and one of us will bring you more.

Does anyone have any questions?
[Wait... answer as required...] Please now start filling pots. I will tell you when the 7 (seven) minutes is up.
[Note start time]

[After 7 minutes have passed ...] Please can everyone stop now, the 7 minutes have finished. Thank you very much for your hard work. We will now come around and collect the trays, pots and gravel.

We will check that the pots contain 7 pieces of blue gravel and 7 pieces of yellow gravel, record the number of pots you have filled, and then begin the next part of the workshop. This will take a few minutes. Please be patient and do not talk. I will explain the next part of the workshop once we are ready.

[Count up and record the number of pots filled, disregarding any pots that clearly do not contain 7+7. Then, allocate each subject a tray by pulling participant letters out of one cup and tray numbers out of another. Record the participant-tray number matches on the session form. Also write the participant/desk letters on the tray lids and the corresponding receipts. While this is going on, the experimenter should read on..]

Alright, we are nearly ready to continue with the workshop. Thank you once again for the effort you put into filling the pots.

As promised, you will be paid for this. 28 Rand has been set aside for each of you. You will receive this at the end of the workshop.

Now I am going to explain the second part of the workshop.

Please listen carefully as these instructions are very important, and, once again, please to not start the task until you are told to do so.

In this part of the workshop, you are all going to be placed in groups of four, but you will never know who else in in your group.

You are each going to start off with a certain amount of money. My assistants have pulled participant letters out of a cup, at random, to find out how much money each of you is going to start off with.

[hold up tray photo...] In a few minutes we are going to hand each of you a tray, like the one in this photo. You will find a copy of this photo to your right.

Each tray has 4 triangles – one triangle for each person in your group. The blue triangle is your triangle. The 3 cream triangles are for the other 3 people in your group.

[hold up counter...] On each tray there will be several counters, like this one, in each triangle. In the photo, the little black round things to the right of the tray are counters.

Each counter is worth R7. So 6 counters in a triangle is worth R42, 3 counters is worth R21, 10 counters is worth R70, and so on.

The counters in the blue triangle show the amount of money you are starting the second part of the workshop with.
The counters in the other 3 cream triangles show the amount of money that the other people in your group are starting the second part of the workshop with.

You will never know who else is in your group, you will just know how much money they are starting out with.

At the end of the workshop, these counters will be changed for real money.

We are going to hand the trays out now so you can see how much money you and the other people in your group have at the start of this part of the workshop. Each tray is covered by a lid - please only lift the lid when the tray is on your desk so that it cannot be seen by anyone else. It is important that each person keeps the contents of his or her tray private.

[Hand out the trays being careful to hand the right tray to the right participant. Meanwhile say...] 

There are a total of 44 counters on each tray. Please do not take any counters away with you. It is very important that we get all the counters back. Please just have a look at the tray so you know how much money you have, and everyone else in your group has, at this point in the workshop.

Remember as you look at the tray, the person with the most counters in the group has the most money, and the person with the fewest counters has the least money at this point in the workshop.

Everyone should now have a tray and should know how much money they and the other people in their group have for the second part of the workshop.

If anyone does not understand their tray, or has any other questions please raise your hand.

OK. In this part of the workshop, if you choose, you can change the amounts of money that you and the other members of your group are to take home at the end of the workshop by moving the counters around the tray.

In other words, you can take one or more counters away from some people, including yourself, and give those counters to other people, including yourself.

If you want, you can move the counters between the triangles any way you choose until you are happy with the number of counters in each triangle. However, you are not allowed to take any counters completely off the tray. There are 44 counters on the trays now and all 44 counters need to be on the trays when they are returned to us.

Let me repeat that as it is important. If you want, you can move the counters between the triangles any way you choose until you are happy with the number of counters in each triangle. However, you are not allowed to take any counters completely off the tray. There are 44 counters on the trays now and all 44 counters need to be on the trays when they are returned to us.

Before you start moving the counters on your tray there is another important thing I need to say. Once everyone has made their choices about moving counters we will collect the trays. Then, for each group of four, we will put the four tray numbers into a cup and pick one at random. The money you receive at the
end of the workshop, on top of the R28 already put aside, will depend on the decision made by the person in your group whose tray number is picked. Every person’s tray has an equal chance of being picked, so every person’s decision has an equal chance of being carried out. It is important that you think about your decision very carefully.

Finally, all the decisions you make will be kept secret. No-one else will ever know whether you were in their group or whether you moved money to them or away from them.

So, in summary:

- The blue triangle is your triangle
- The other triangles relate to 3 other people but you don’t know who they are
- The counters are equivalent to money
- You can move the counters on your tray any way you choose
- If and how you move them will never be known by anyone else
- Of the four people in your group, only one person’s decision about final payments will be carried out

If you do not understand what you are being asked to do or how it might affect yourself and others, or if you have any other questions, please raise your hand and we will come to you.

You may now make your decisions about whether and where to move counters. You can have as much time as you want. When you have arranged the counters as you see fit please close the lid of your tray and put up your hand. One of us will then collect your tray from you.

[When all trays collected...] One of us will now come and give you a short questionnaire that we would like you to fill out. This questionnaire is the third part of the workshop. When this part of the workshop is finished you will be paid and will be free to leave. Please note that the questionnaire is on both sides of the pages. When you have finished filling in the questionnaire, raise your hand again.

[Hand out and later collect questionnaires. Calculate pay with reference to notes in next section of this document. Draw up receipts.]

We are now finished. Thank you for being so patient and thank you for participating in this workshop. We have worked out how much money each of you is to be paid. In a minute I will ask you, one by one, to come to the desk by the door to receive and sign for your money. Then you will be free to leave.
Script for DJ Experiments  
Cape Town, May/June 2011  

UNEARNED – EMPTYING

[Before entering the lab subjects need to select a participant letter at random and be asked to sit at the desk bearing their participant letter. Record participant letters on the session form. Once everyone is seated...]

Thank you for coming here today and for agreeing to take part in this workshop.

When you came in today, you each chose a letter.

This is your player identification letter.

Please keep this player identification letter with you. You will need it at the end of the session to claim your money.

Does everyone understand?

We are now ready to begin so please could you all listen carefully to the instructions.

While the workshop is going on, please do not talk to anyone other than me and my assistants.

If you have any questions, please raise your hand and one of us will come to your desk and answer your question. If you talk to the people around you, you will be asked to leave.

There are three parts to the workshop. I am now going to explain what we want you to do in the first part but please do not start the task until you are told to do so.

You are going to spend 7 minutes helping us sort out some materials that are to be used in another workshop later today, or tomorrow.

We are not asking you to do this for free. You will be paid for helping us in this way.

hold up example pot...] On your desk, you will find some small plastic pots, like this one, containing blue and yellow gravel and two larger containers.

Please empty the small pots, one or two at a time, and put the blue gravel into one of the larger containers and the yellow gravel into the other.

Also, please be gentle with the small pots and try not to break the hinges on the lids!

Finally, if you are running out of pots please raise your hand and one of my assistants will bring you more.

Does anyone have any questions? [Wait... answer as required...]

Please now start emptying pots. I will tell you when the 7 (seven) minutes is up. [Note start time]
[After 7 minutes have passed …] Please can everyone stop now, the 7 minutes have finished. Thank you very much for your hard work. We will now come around and collect the trays, pots and gravel.

We will record the number of pots you have emptied, check that the sorting has been done correctly and then set up the next part of the workshop. This will take a few minutes. Please be patient and do not talk. I will explain the next part of the workshop once we are ready.

[Count up and record the number of pots sorted, disregarding any pots from which the gravel has been left unsorted. Then, allocate each subject a tray by pulling participant letters out of one cup and tray numbers out of another. Record the participant letter/tray number matches on the session form. Also write the participant/desk letters on the tray lids and the corresponding receipts. While this is going on, the experimenter should read on.]

Alright, we are nearly ready to continue with the workshop. Thank you once again for the effort you put into emptying the pots.

As promised, you will be paid for this. 28 Rand has been set aside for each of you. You will receive this at the end of the workshop.

Now I am going to explain the second part of the workshop.

Please listen carefully as these instructions are very important, and, once again, please to not start the task until you are told to do so.

In this part of the workshop you are all going to be placed in groups of four, but you will never know who else is in your group.

Also, you are each going to start off with a certain amount of money. My assistants have pulled participant letters out of a cup, at random, to find out how much money each of you is going to start off with.

[hold up tray photo…] In a few minutes we are going to hand each of you a tray, like the one in this photo. You will find a copy of this photo to your right.

Each tray has 4 triangles – one triangle for each person in your group. The blue triangle is your triangle. The 3 cream triangles are for the other 3 people in your group.

[hold up counter…] On each tray there will be several counters, like this one, in each triangle. In the photo, the little black round things to the right of the tray are counters.

Each counter is worth R7. So 6 counters in a triangle is worth R42, 3 counters is worth R21, 10 counters is worth R70, and so on.

The counters in the blue triangle show the amount of money you are starting the second part of the workshop with.

The counters in the other 3 cream triangles show the amount of money that the other people in your group are starting the second part of the workshop with.
You will never know who else is in your group - you will just know how much money they are starting out with.

At the end of the workshop, these counters will be changed for real money.

We are going to hand the trays out now so you can see how much money you and the other people in your group have at the start of this part of the workshop. Each tray is covered by a lid - please only lift the lid when the tray is on your desk so that it cannot be seen by anyone else. It is important that each person keeps the contents of his or her tray private.

[Hand out the trays being careful to hand the right tray to the right participant. Meanwhile say...]  

There are a total of 44 counters on each tray. Please do not take any counters away with you. It is very important that we get all the counters back. Also, please do not move the counters around until we tell you that you may do so. Please just have a look at the tray so you know how much money you have, and everyone else in your group has, at this point in the workshop.

Remember as you look at the tray, the person with the most counters in the group has the most money. The person with the fewest counters has the least money at this point in the workshop.  

Everyone should now have a tray and should know how much money they and the other people in their group have for the second part of the workshop.  

If anyone does not understand their tray, or has any other questions please raise your hand?

OK. In this part of the workshop, if you choose, you can change the amounts of money that you and the other members of your group are to take home at the end of the workshop by moving the counters around the tray.

In other words, you can take one or more counters away from some people, including yourself, and give those counters to other people, including yourself.

If you want, you can move the counters between the triangles any way you choose until you are happy with the number of counters in each triangle. However, you are not allowed to take any counters completely off the tray. There are 44 counters on the trays now and all 44 counters need to be on the trays when they are returned to us.

Let me repeat that as it is important. If you want, you can move the counters between the triangles any way you choose until you are happy with the number of counters in each triangle. However, you are not allowed to take any counters completely off the tray. There are 44 counters on the trays now and all 44 counters need to be on the trays when they are returned to us.

Before you start moving the counters on your tray there is another important thing I need to say. Once everyone has made their choices about moving counters we will collect the trays. Then, for each group of four, we will put the four tray numbers into a cup and pick one at random. The money you receive at the end of the workshop, on top of the R28 already put aside, will depend on the decision made by the person in your group whose tray number is picked. Every person’s tray has an equal chance of being
picked, so every person’s decision has an equal chance of being carried out. It is important that you think about your decision very carefully.

Finally, all the decisions you make will be kept secret. To-one else will ever know whether you were in their group or whether you moved money to them or away from them.

So, in summary:

- The blue triangle is your triangle
- The other triangles relate to 3 other people but you don’t know who they are
- The counters are equivalent to money
- You can move the counters on your tray any way you choose
- If and how you move them will never be known by anyone else
- Of the four people in your group, only one person’s decision about final payments will be carried out

If you do not understand what you are being asked to do or how it might affect yourself and others, or if you have any other questions, please raise your hand and we will come to you.

You may now make your decisions about whether and where to move counters. You can have as much time as you want. When you have arranged the counters as you see fit please close the lid of your tray and put up your hand. One of us will then collect your tray from you.

[When all trays collected...] One of us will now come and give you a short questionnaire that we would like you to fill out. This questionnaire is the third part of the workshop. When this part of the workshop is finished you will be paid and will be free to leave. Please note that the questionnaire is on both sides of the pages. When you have finished filling in the questionnaire, raise your hand again.

[Hand out and later collect questionnaires. Calculate pay with reference to notes in next section of this document. Draw up receipts.]

We are now finished. Thank you for being so patient and thank you for participating in this workshop. We have worked out how much money each of you is to be paid. In a minute I will ask you, one by one, to come to the desk by the door to receive and sign for your money. Then you will be free to leave.
Research on Individual Decision-Making

Thank you for taking the time to participate in this research today. Please take a few moments to fill out the questionnaire below. All your answers will be kept confidential. There are no right or wrong answers, so please answer honestly.

1. What is your date of birth? (DD/MM/YYYY) ______________

2. How old are you today? (in years) ______________________

3. Are you: 1. Male   2. Female


5. Population group:

6. What is the name of the community or suburb that you live in?
   ____________________________________________________________________________

7. What is the highest level of education you have completed?
   1. = NO SCHOOLING
   2. = Grade 1/Class 1
   3. = Grade 2/Class 2
   4. = STANDARD 1/Grade 3
   5. = STANDARD 2/Grade 4
   6. = STANDARD 3/Grade 5
   7. = STANDARD 4/Grade 6
   8. = STANDARD 5/Grade 7
   9. = STANDARD 6/Grade 8
   10. = STANDARD 7/Grade 9
   11. = STANDARD 8/Grade 10
   12. = STANDARD 9/Grade 11
   13. = STANDARD 10/MATRIC /Grade 12
   14. = NTC I
   15. = NTC II
   16. = DIPLOMA/CERTIFICATE WITH LESS THAN STD10/ GRADE 12 *
   17. = DIPLOMA/CERTIFICATE WITH STD10*
   18. = Undergraduate DEGREE
   19. = POSTGRADUATE DEGREE OR DIPLOMA*
   20. = OTHER, SPECIFY .................................................................
   21. = DON'T KNOW

*Diplomas or certificates should be of at least six months study duration full time (or equivalent).
8. Please select the option that best describes your current situation?
   1. ☐ Full-time student at school/college/university
   2. ☐ Self employed
   3. ☐ Unemployed
   4. ☐ In paid employment (full- or part-time)
   5. ☐ Unemployed and on a training programme
   6. ☐ On maternity leave
   7. ☐ Looking after family or home
   8. ☐ Retired from paid work altogether
   9. ☐ Long-term sick or disabled
   10. ☐ Other (please explain_______________________________________________)

9. Have you been unemployed at any time during the past 3 years, i.e., since early June 2009? (students should not count winter/spring/summer holidays unless they claimed benefits)
   1. ☐ Yes
   2. ☐ No

10. If yes, for how many months in total were you unemployed during the past 3 years?
    ______________________________________

11. Do you currently do any work for which you earn money, i.e., do you have a job or a business?
    1. ☐ Yes
    2. ☐ No

12. If yes, how much money do you take home each month from this work (after tax i.e. net income)?
    R______________________________

13. Is this work full time or part-time?
    1. ☐ Full time
    2. ☐ Part-time
    3. ☐ Not Applicable (if you are not working)

14. If you are currently working for money, when was the last time you were either a full-time student or unemployed?
    Last time a full time student (mm/yyyy): _______________________
    Last time unemployed (mm/yyyy): _______________________

85
15. If you are NOT currently working for money, do you have any other form of income at the moment? (you may tick more than one box)
   1. [ ] Pension
   2. [ ] Child Care Grant
   3. [ ] Disability Grant
   4. [ ] Unemployment Insurance (UIF)
   5. [ ] Remittances or transfers from people outside my household
   6. [ ] Support from others in my household (income or meals and a place to stay)
   7. [ ] Other _______________________

16. If you are NOT currently working for money and NOT currently a full time student, when was the last time you were either a full-time student or in full time paid employment?
   Last time a full time student (mm/yyyy): _____________________________
   Last time full time paid employment (mm/yyyy): ______________________

17. If you are NOT currently working for money and NOT currently a full time student, are you now or have you recently (last 6 months) received any training designed to help you gain employment?
   1. [ ] Yes          2. [ ] No

18. If you are a full-time student, please write the name of the degree you are studying for, e.g., BCom, BBusSci
    _____________________________________________________________

19. If you are a full-time student, when was the last time you were either in full-time paid employment or unemployed and claiming benefits (UIF)?
    Last time in full time paid employment (mm/yyyy): ______________________
    Last time unemployed and claiming UIF (mm/yyyy): ______________________
20. How many people (including you) live in your household? (here, you should include all those people who sleep in the same household as you on a regular basis)

_________________

21. Would you describe your household as:

1. [ ] Rich  
2. [ ] Upper income  
3. [ ] Middle income  
4. [ ] Lower income  
5. [ ] Poor

22. Which of the following groups or individuals do you think has the greatest responsibility to help the poor? (choose one answer only)

1. [ ] Churches  
2. [ ] Private charities  
3. [ ] Government  
4. [ ] Families & relatives of the poor  
5. [ ] The poor themselves

Below are a number of statements. Please tell us whether you agree or disagree with each one.

23. “The current distribution of money and wealth in South Africa is fair” Do you agree or disagree?

1. [ ] Strongly agree  
2. [ ] Agree  
3. [ ] Neutral  
4. [ ] Disagree  
5. [ ] Strongly disagree

24. “If you treat others well, they will treat you well in return” Do you agree or disagree?

1. [ ] Strongly agree  
2. [ ] Agree  
3. [ ] Neutral  
4. [ ] Disagree  
5. [ ] Strongly disagree

25. “Most people can generally be trusted” Do you agree or disagree?

1. [ ] Strongly agree  
2. [ ] Agree  
3. [ ] Neutral  
4. [ ] Disagree  
5. [ ] Strongly disagree

26. “People are generally quite selfish” Do you agree or disagree?

1. [ ] Strongly agree  
2. [ ] Agree  
3. [ ] Neutral  
4. [ ] Disagree  
5. [ ] Strongly disagree

27. “Most people, if they get the chance, will try to take advantage of you” Do you agree or disagree?

1. [ ] Strongly agree  
2. [ ] Agree  
3. [ ] Neutral  
4. [ ] Disagree  
5. [ ] Strongly disagree

28. Finally, look around the room and tell us how many of the other people in the workshop do you know well and think of as friends?

_________________