
Access from the University of Nottingham repository:
http://eprints.nottingham.ac.uk/27895/1/ANTIVICE%20LIVES%20BLANK.pdf

Copyright and reuse:

The Nottingham ePrints service makes this work by researchers of the University of Nottingham available open access under the following conditions.

This article is made available under the University of Nottingham End User licence and may be reused according to the conditions of the licence. For more details see: http://eprints.nottingham.ac.uk/end_user_agreement.pdf

A note on versions:

The version presented here may differ from the published version or from the version of record. If you wish to cite this item you are advised to consult the publisher's version. Please see the repository url above for details on accessing the published version and note that access may require a subscription.

For more information, please contact eprints@nottingham.ac.uk
Anti-Vice Lives: Peopling the Archives of Prostitution in Interwar India

“The archive is anything of which a set of questions is asked and the nature of the archive is largely, but not entirely, defined by the nature of questions asked of it. The problem therefore is not of sexuality and the archive per se, or of gaps in the archives. It is a question of playing one archive against another, of conversations within and outside of archives, of romancing the archives, of using parallel, alternative, official, and popular archives simultaneously. It is in such interplay that more interesting stories are revealed.”

Having spent ten years working on “anti-vice” campaigns in colonial India, looking back on this research I am often struck by the busyness of the archives, and the diversity of the people one meets there. Beyond the staff and colleagues in particular archives, the most recurrent person one meets in the archives is oneself; constantly refiguring both the archive and the researcher by the questions one asks of the indexes, cartons and stacks. But in the diverse archive I have constructed regarding the regulation of prostitution in interwar India, two very different sets of people emerge: the campaigners; and the campaigned against/for. Neither set is stable or homogenous. Campaigners included disciplinarians, libertarians, internationalists, Indian nationalists and social reformers. Depending on their approach, the prostitute was campaigned against, or with and for. The opinion of prostitutes regarding the latter distinction is rarely archived. However, at often random and unpredictable points in this decade of research, documents have emerged which suggest a glimmer of insight into the lives of women who worked with sex. These women emerge as victims and agents, entrepreneurs and commodities, as defiant but also, as will be show below, as often violently debased.

But as surprising as the variety of individuals in the documents were the scalar worlds they offered insights into. The brothel was often a local, regional, national, imperial and international space, all at once. As the League of Nations found out during its 1931 travelling commission of enquiry into traffic in women and children in the east, there was very little evidence of international trafficking in India. But the imperial government and its official and non-official populations, as well as Indian entrepreneurs and labourers, were internationally mobile, thus making diseased prostitutes in India a transnational problem. They were worried about in New Delhi and London, while the policies adopted not only to reduce their levels of disease but also to increase their standard of life were pondered by the League of Nations in Geneva. This chapter will explore the anti-vice lives of interwar India from two scales and two perspectives. The first half will look at depictions of prostitutes in anti-vice literature, examining the way in which they were imaginatively portrayed.
through their potent locations, but also abstracted into sterile lists and tabulations. The second half will examine how intimate traces of the lives both of campaigners and prostitutes themselves found their way to Geneva, forming an archive of distant intimacies in the vaults of the Palace of Nations.

As such, this chapter follows Charu Gupta’s advice to mix and contrast archives, drawing material from the National Archives of India in New Delhi, the League of Nations archive in Geneva, and pamphlets collected by the British Library in London. The nature and scale of these repositories is not coincidental. Files and documents were often created for transition between scales: provincial summaries for central governments; national precis for international surveillance; and even finely detailed minutiae for the most global of audiences. These reports were most often statistical summaries but they did, occasionally, maintain information on the various lives upon which both vice and anti-vice depended.

In her study of the regulation of prostitution in late-colonial Bombay, Ashwini Tambe provided a sensitive reading of just such a life and death, that of the sex worker Akootai. I had come across the same file in my investigation of Bombay’s pioneering attempts to devise a new form of prostitution regulation following the discrediting of the tolerated brothel system around the years of the First World War. Perhaps the key case in the overturning of belief in the relative safety of “red light districts” was the prosecution of Miroza Syedkhan and his two female accomplices Gangabai and Gomtibai. His crime was the torture and murder of Akootai, one of the workers in a brothel that he managed, who had attempted to escape, in late February 1917. The court trial documents included 15 witness statements that offer a rare degree of insight into the brothel system in Bombay before the enforcing of its Prevention of Prostitution Act (from 1923). Tambe provides a sensitive and insightful reading of the subaltern life of Akootai, and the sociological narratives we can unpack from the texts. The witness statements are harrowing, but must be read as highly mediated, translated and multiply transcribed. Yet even through these filters, vivid traces of the corporeality of violence and the multiple registers of agency, blame and guilt are preserved. The Police Surgeon detailed Akootai’s broken body as an archive of the violence against her: the three broken ribs; the bruises and 18 weals all over her body; the stench of garlic and onion (skins) in her stomach, which she had been forced to eat; while also recording that “[t]he legs, buttocks and private parts were blackened by lunar caustic,” strong lunar caustic had been injected into the vagina and caused much swelling.” The caustic had previously been forcibly applied to Akootai’s genitals to treat a venereal sore. The treatment made the symptoms worse so she refused her fourth client of the night, who left the brothel without paying, despite Gomtibai’s suggestion that he “… have intercourse with Akootai by force against the order of nature.” Having escaped anal rape, a fellow brothel inmate,
Phooli, recounted how Akootai tricked the cook into giving her the keys to brothel. She escaped but was caught, brought back to the brothel, and severely beaten.

Phooli’s witness statement detailed how any woman refusing to take clients was forced to drink Syedkhan’s urine, and of how they were forced to watch the beating of Akootai. The witness statements are remarkable for their detailing of the brothel’s everyday lives, but Akootai’s voice is mostly absent, though she is not entirely silent. Her cries after capture were recalled slightly differently by each witness, and make for harrowing hearing: “Do not beat me, do not beat me” recalled Phooli; “For God’s sake do not beat me” recalled fellow brothel inmate Moti; “Do not beat me; I will not run away” heard the cook; while another “prostitute” in the brothel, Jijabai, heard the even more distressing “God—I will eat your night soil—For God’s sake do not beat me.”

Accounts of her last day chart the liminal hours between the beating and her death. Phooli recalled that “Akootai woke up but she was not able to walk so she went scrawling to the fire to foment herself…” while Jijabi recalled Akootai folding her hands in supplication, begging Gangabai to beat her no more, while saying “I will not run away now.” She died during the night and would have been cremated, leaving no trace, had a policeman not become suspicious when the corpse was carried through the street.

While Akootai was undoubtedly a victim, she certainly was not without action or voice. She refused clients, orchestrated an escape, and berated her cousin when he had previously visited her in the brothel. If her agency in life was brutally cut short, the case resulting from her murder guaranteed her an afterlife that transformed the regulation of prostitution in India and discredited the brothel system through the publicity the case generated. The witness statements quoted above were read in Delhi and elsewhere, causing widespread revulsion. In 1917 the central government ordered a review of red light districts across the country, which spurred the overturning of long-held beliefs about the social and biological safety of brothels. The resulting investigations tell us much about the lives and views of governors and anti-vice campaigners, though the women who were supposedly being saved remain obscured, often beneath metaphors and synecdoches of place.

“Calcutta Vice: the Dragon of Calcutta Lust”

Reverend Herbert Anderson had been living in Calcutta since the 1890s, campaigning for social improvement and against vice as the Indian Secretary of the Baptist Missionary Society, a founding member of the National Missionary Council and a member of the Calcutta Vigilance Committee. In 1921 he published the pamphlet *Calcutta Vice*, an exposé of the seemingly omnipresent geography of prostitution in the ex-capital, relating it to the fate of the city’s children, “vice areas”, the
exploiters and city fathers, civil morals, medicine, drink and policy. He framed his own expertise in terms of the shock the Government of India had received in 1917:

“The curtain was lifted from the brothel conditions of Bombay and revealed a sight so unpleasantly revolting that the Imperial Government approached Provincial Governments to learn if similar evils had any counterpart in other Indian cities. A girl called Akootai had been treated cruelly, slowly tortured and finally murdered. She was a slave-debtor, earning for her keepers, but getting free board, clothes and ornaments [jewellery]. Her earnings were not, however, large enough for her avaricious owners, a man and two bad women. They tortured her slowly to death.”

On 14th December 1917 the Home Department had, indeed, forwarded details of the case to provincial governments, asking if they had similar evils and what remedies they had discovered. Ten months later the central government surveyed the responses, and was reassured that no other city had as severe a problem as Bombay, and decided that provincial governments should be left to legislate as they felt fit. After Burma and Bombay, which passed legislation targeting brothel keeping, procurement, soliciting and trafficking in 1921 and 1923 respectively, Calcutta was one of the first cities to respond, passing it’s Suppression of Immoral Traffic Act (SITA) in 1923 which included similar powers but omitted powers against soliciting. The SITA built on substantial campaigning by local women’s organisations, though their contribution escapes most official narratives. Officials were more willing to collaborate, however, with “colonial civil society”, of which Anderson’s pamphleteering formed a part. He was asked by the Bengal government to help draft a response to the 1917 governmental circular, drawing upon his experience as a missionary and as a leading figure in Calcutta’s colonial civil society. Though he responded that there was nothing as extreme as the Bombay case, he felt that the city needed action. It had been too long since a pamphlet had addressed “commercialised vice” in Calcutta, perhaps referencing Kerr’s 1886 The Social Evil in Calcutta, or “Verax”’s The Social Evil in South Calcutta from 1895.

Like Kerr, Anderson classified prostitutes by their location, class, fee and clientele from the busti (slum) prostitute catering to unmarried industrial labourers; to brothel inhabitants; to kept mistresses and dancing girls. Here the typology of habitation reproduces in a different register a more abstract series of classificatory hierarchies, which discursively aligned the normativities and abnormalities of class, gender, sex and race. But there was also a haptic, multi-sensory and complex metaphorical rhetoric of displacement, association and connotation at play. It was not just the case that the rank of geographical hierarchy correlated with the rank of the “prostitute”. Rather, the haptic geography of location was used to embed these women in their place, and to imbue those places with all the miasmic and contagionist force of moral and social unhygiene.
Their places were environments of putrescent decay and defilement, but they themselves were agents of venereal disease and contamination. \( ^{xxvii} \) Regarding Calcutta’s social vice, for instance, Anderson insisted: “It can be no pleasure to any honest citizen to drag out the slimy sins of immorality from their dark hiding places, and hold them up for the city to gaze at. But there are times when it must be done. And this is one of them.” \(^{xxviii} \) In a later section on “vice areas”, these geographies were expanded upon. He insisted that Calcutta was not an immoral city, and that the dozen vice areas were few and far between. They, however, offended the senses and the mind. A small site near Wellesley Street was described as a “stagnant cesspool” of what used to be the “repulsive headquarters of European immorality” in Calcutta. The largest area, on either side of Chitpore Road, was claimed to be the historic home of vice, and thus had been allowed to remain. To Anderson, it offended health, law and morals:

> On the Indian principle of segregating its trades this trade was permitted to stay where it started and grew until to-day you have a moral gangrene in the heart of the Indian quarter occupying hundreds of houses in Jorasanko, Jorabagan, Burtolla and Shampukur, the home of eight to ten thousand fallen sisters. This area laughs at civil authority, law and administration, and is a standing contradiction to the purity of ideal that modern Indian claims as its glorious heritage.\(^{xxix} \)

Within many of these metaphors and adjectives lies the classic ambivalence regarding the prostitute; woman as destroyed and destroyer; the object of pity and of fear; consumer of men and families, but consumed herself by poverty, disease and sex.\(^{xxx} \) So in Anderson’s introduction, entitled “Calcutta Vice: the Dragon of Calcutta Lust”, the figure of St George, embossed on British sovereign coins killing a vicious dragon, was employed. On his crusade he was said to have saved the town of Sylene which was being devastated by a dragon with a gross appetite for human flesh, especially that of poor girls. “Calcutta vice” was compared to the dragon, with Anderson claiming that 15,000 women were professionally disreputable; it was vice that was consuming children, at a “computational average” of one per day.\(^{xxxi} \)

The dragon, however, slithers from the lance: what was vice, and at whom was the blame directed? The men who paid for sex, or the women who provided it, sold their children into prostitution, and imbibed the secrets of the oldest profession into these nubile young offerings? Likewise, the crusade lacked a moral compass; where was it heading, and to what end? Was the crusade an imperial one, against oriental sin, or was it Anderson’s abolitionist campaign against the British and their official toleration of vice? In tying up the metaphor, Anderson attempted to pin down both the dragon, and the knight, by reformulating the challenge: Was there no son of Bengal willing to protect the Bengal womanhood? The problem was thus a failure of Bengali manhood, a common and, by this time,
increasingly desperate ploy of colonial masculinity. The ambivalence continued. In the “cess pool” mentioned above, one encountered both aggressive pimps (men who coordinated the exploitation of prostitutes) but also “aggressive women” who came out into the street to attract trade, including European seafaring men and boys.

The reading of women through place, and the supposed vulnerability of the military, offered by Anderson can also be seen in a 1926 pamphlet by MS Mani entitled “Pen Pictures of the Dancing Girl.” The aim of this pamphlet was to draw attention to the overlapping professions of dancing girls and “abject prostitution.” The pamphlet opened by going beyond an association of these women with abject place, to their abject nature and history: “The origin of the dancing girl is as dim as the origin of the protoplasm.” Though having a noble place in Indian history, these girls were said to have descended from the sublime to the ridiculous, from high ideals to obsession with clothes and money:

Where there is prostitution, there is drunkenness. Cupidity and Bacchus are hobgoblins; they are vampires of humanity. Dancing girls consume European wines without method or measure; they revel in bacchanalian songs without rhyme or reason... The nautch-woman is a museum of diseases which is of an internal rather than an external nature. The rose has prickles and yet it is plucked...

The pamphlet goes on to describe the growth of prostitution in Bombay, Calcutta and Madras. Discussions of Madras in historical and current literature do not reflect its status as the third Presidency city; it was not as popular with Europeans, in part due to its tropical climate and less cosmopolitan culture. But it also had its vice areas, described here as vivid sites of visual and aural enticement:

At the close of every day, after the hour half past six, near the threash-holds of their houses, arrayd in white saris, prostitutes of complexion dark as the night of a New-Moon day, could be seen standing like statues without the least indication of motion. If the white saris worn by them would indicate to the passer by, that some one is at every door, yet their faces are not distinguishable from one another. If the passengers on the road, for fear of being over-run by carts through pressure of traffic, should abandon the middle of the road and pass close by one side of it, ie close to these godowns of prostitutes, voices crying ‘come here’ ‘come here’ would strike their ears. Strangers unacquainted with the above particulars and the true nature of these calls, would naturally turn round on hearing them and this leads to further conversation with those lewd creatures ending, we are told, in a great many things which, we cannot with decorum, mention here. If any ignorant man caught in the clutches of these heinous women should have sexual intercourse with them, he is sure to contract
incurable venereal diseases which finally cause his death or else till the day of his death, he has to make use of the margosa-leaves to drive away the flies that torment his ulcerous body and to allay the irritation by the peculiar balmy breeze from the leaves. Hence it is said that after Eleven o’clock in the nights it is rather dangerous to pass through those streets. The total population of these prostitutes we are told, is about more than Five thousands.

Here the widely commented-upon darker skin of the local women was alluded to so as to obliterate their difference, annihilating them into the darkness of their abodes. Through (not in spite of) this groundedness they tempted men; lacking body, yet wholly embodied; voices in the night, searching out innocent ears (it was suggested that Odakkal Street derived its name from “who do you call”, a query often put by European gentlemen and “ignorant soldiers”). The voices were wily and enticing, yet lewd and animalistic. Calcutta, in contrast, was a modern and cosmopolitan city in which prostitutes attracted men not through their darkness but through their light:

It is not surprising to find that, living in more luxuriant circumstances than those that live in the district centres, the city harlots, with all their paraphernalia of coaches, Broughams, Landous, Victorias or Motor cars, should astound and enchant even those that are in good positions. Almost all their houses, particularly their drawing rooms are fitted with electric-lights and pankahs. About Fourteen thousands, we are told, is the total population of the prostitutes in Calcutta alone.

These women don’t just become their place, but also their possessions which, vitally, service the purposes of vice. Their carriages and cars made them mobile threats. They could be found flaunting themselves at flower gardens, theatrical halls, marinas, road sides and restaurants “…to lure and entice the young men loitering there, with their subtle arts of signs and beacons.”

Common to this pamphlet and that of Anderson is an association of women with place, which goes beyond a space of correlative hierarchies to appeal to affective registers of smell, sight, and sound. Mani updated these places to the electronic age in Calcutta, just as Anderson’s piece had been forward looking in other ways. First, it appealed to “Mahatma” Gandhi’s disgust at the idea of dancing girls and sin, and his insistence that swaraj (self-rule) could only come through respecting a country’s women and through killing the “…sins that kill the man in us, and make us brutes.”

Anderson also understood that to make people care about an archive, and about a crime, it has to be peopled. The problem, however, was that of balancing length and detail. As the author of the Rangoon Vigilance Society Annual Report for 1930-31 would later put it: “…It is very difficult in writing a report of work done to leave the right amount in to make it interesting, and the right amount out to keep it confidential.” Their solution was to place an alphabetical list of cases at the end of the
report, such that a reader could assess the types of case under review. This is a challenge that faced Anderson, and which faces us now. The detailing of Akootai’s murder is incredibly rare but that does not mean that case information regarding prostitutes was uncommon. On the contrary, as the internationalist movement to stamp out trafficking, and tolerated brothel zones, picked up pace, so did the codification of prostitutes and their treatment. The sexual subaltern are definitely not defined by their absence from the archive; an archive lacking mention of the majority of the population would be almost useless. Colonial archives do not simply exclude prostitutes from their records. Rather, they are over-written, interpreted and represented. They are spoken for, they do not speak; our challenge is to speak of them without speaking for them. One form of silencing is numerical; we are given numbers of prostitutes in an area, how many were arrested etc. Another form is alphabetical; the reduction of lives to alphabetised lists, encapsulating a person in a letter that can neither be read nor returned. This leaves us with a dilemma. Should we reproduce the lists, attempt to expand upon them, or further tabulate them into digits, sums and algorithms? Anderson detailed 13 (or, I should say, A-M) cases of child kidnapping from 1917-21; victims of the dragon of lust. A sense of his annotations is given below. The details are hopelessly inadequate, yet offer vital clues as to the mobilities and immobilities of vice in Calcutta.

A. Left with her brother-in-law to visit Hazaribagh, but was over-carried by train to Howrah. She fell into hands of some desiring person, but was rescued by a constable
B. Brought to Calcutta by a distant relative with a view to being made a prostitute. Returned to her husband.
C. Two prostitutes arrested for having in their possession five minor girls. One woman fined Rs200, all children were provided for.
D. A Hindu wife aged 12 with incapable husband fell into hands of procurers, was kept in a brothel two days and rescued. Insufficient evidence for trial.
E. A Muslim girl of 11 decoyed from her home on pretence of going to see sister; thrashed and gagged and taken to Calcutta, where she was seduced and made into a “...woman of the town.”
F. A Muslim girl aged 14 was a victim of wrongful confinement; the owner had been prosecuted.
G. A Muslim wife aged 17 was abducted by two prostitutes who were sisters, brought to a Calcutta brothel and kept behind locked doors. This case became famous as a corrupt Sub-Inspector of police helped the abductors, “... keeping the girl for his own us in their brothel.” Bad treatment of girl, tried to commit suicide twice. A visitor to the house rescued her. Two women given sentences of 7 years.
H. A 12 years old girl. A mistri (carpenter) helped by a prostitute kidnapped her from her husband, brought to Calcutta and offered her for sale for Rs200.
I. Daughter of Brahmin priest, 5 years old. Prostitute owner of a house claimed she had procured her from a beggar two and a half years before.
J. A Hindu girl of five. Accused from Benares received 2 years for kidnapping and stealing ornaments.

K. A minor girl abducted with sister, brought to Calcutta, seduced and put in brothel. Accused got one year.

L. A little girl of three and a half years old. Obtained by a prostitute who kept her in a brothel as her child. Fined Rs200 and given one days detention.

M. A minor girl, kidnapped for purposes of sale for prostitution. The accused got six months rigorous imprisonment.

Though fragmented, these letters offer us the briefest of correspondences regarding the movement of females into prostitution. These originary moments are almost impossible to read for causes or detailings of the experiences of prostitutes. But it was precisely these sorts of listings that were pored over in Geneva by the new internationalist champions of anti-vice; the distant intimacies of their archives will be explored below.

Geneva’s distant intimacies

Writing in 1921, Herbert Anderson was coming towards the end of his Indian career. In 1926 he joined the Calcutta Vigilance Association in persuading the Association of Moral and Social Hygiene (AMSH) to send a qualified anti-vice campaigner to the city for three years as his replacement. Meliscent Shephard ended up staying in India for nearly 20 years. During that time she collaborated closely with the League of Nations and was one of its longest standing champions in India. 1921 had also marked the formation of the Advisory Committee on Traffic in Women and Children (TWC), which met annually from 1922 in Geneva and adopted a generally anti-regulationist approach and increasingly advocated the abolition of tolerated brothels. India had signed the 1921 convention on TWC, which committed it to taking measures to detect and prevent trafficking, and to sending information to Geneva annually regarding its efforts. The most regular of these reports sent information collected from provincial governments, who forwarded statistics regarding arrests, whether of those organising or participating in prostitution. These statistics were printed in the Advisory Committee’s annual reports. But the League also worked persistently to gather information on the nature of prostitution in its member states, and to amass evidence on the impact of various reforms and anti-vice campaigns. It is in response to these sorts of requests that the Geneva archive became a repository of some exceptionally rich insights into the lives not only of prostitutes but also of anti-vice campaigners in India (and elsewhere).

In 1933 the League had organised the International Convention for the Suppression of the Traffic in Women of Full Age. It punished trafficking of women and children even if they gave their consent, to be enforced by new national laws where necessary, and organised the sharing of information about traffickers between countries. However, a re-definition of “country” to include protectorates and suzerainties meant that traffic between British and Princely India could have fallen under the
League’s jurisdiction, so the Government of India refused to sign the convention. But the League continued to request information from India regarding the provincial effects of the abolition of licensed houses (here also taken to include tolerated brothel zones) between 1928-33, which it considered Bombay’s Prevention of Prostitution Act (1921) and Madras’s Suppression of Immoral Traffic Act (1930) to have brought about. Beyond the ending of segregationist policies the League also wanted to investigate the measures taken to protect those women and children evicted from brothels, so it distributed a questionnaire in 1934 enquiring about rescue homes and rehabilitation institutions, their funding, their classifications of inmates, their recording of cases, their dealing with relatives, and methods of rehabilitation.

The variety of replies attests to the fact that the Government of India very clearly felt that rehabilitation and rescue was a job for civil society, not for the state. Perhaps the decisive feature of these organisations was their bridging of state and society, marking both the state’s intrusion into colonial social work (or a governmentalized society) but also the reshaping of the state by the demands of civil society (what has been called the governmentisation of the state). This interplay allowed the government to claim (to both nationalists and internationalists) that it was doing something to counter both the social and moral hygiene risks of prostitution. So, for instance, the reply from Bombay outlined the work done by the Bombay Presidency Women’s Council Home, the League of Mercy Shelter, the Salvation Army Women’s Home, the Bombay Vigilance Association Shelter, the St Catherine’s Rescue Home and the Hindu Women’s Rescue Home.

The questionnaire responses give us a sense of the complex interconnections between the state and anti-vice civil society institutions in interwar India, but also of the absence of regular state financial support. The homes took cases from both the public and the police, just as their funding was partly from voluntary subscriptions and partly from occasional government grants. Just as Anderson used the Calcutta Vigilance Association to bridge his social, religious and state interests, so the Bombay Vigilance Association represented the organisations listed above to the state (Shephard, Anderson’s successor in Calcutta, later crafted the Association for Moral and Social Hygiene into this representational mould in Delhi).

The homes were limited in the state resources they could draw upon. There was no provision for repatriating foreign girls, nor were there institutions to support the “mentally defective” (only girls classified by the Police Surgeon could be sent to the lunatic asylum), while babies would be handed over to “Foundling Homes” or persons willing to adopt them (the opinion of their mothers is not mentioned). As such, the success of the homes often depended on the regional support that civil society networks could offer. For instance, the Salvation Army’s Eastern India branches, staffed by
Christian workers, collaborated with the Bengal Presidency Council of Women regarding its Rescue Homes, in which babies and mothers were kept together until the child was one year old (what happened thereafter was not mentioned). There were some provinces with more progressive funding schemes, however. The Bombay’s Children Aid Society received girls from both the police and the Bombay Vigilance Association, and was more than half-financed by the Government. It kept girls until their associated adults had been processed by the Courts, and until any venereal disease had been cured, before passing them on to a school or home. Perhaps because of its government funding, the Society provided a full reply to the League questionnaire, giving a rare insight into the mindset of a small scale anti-vice organisation. Its Superintendent was Katharine Davis, who was running a home in Bombay when Meliscent Shephard visited in 1929. When penning her questionnaire reply in September 1934 she despaired of the chances of rehabilitation for her wards (“Supervision by day does not prevent a girl from being ruined by night”). Girls faced, it was believed, the triple obstacles of nature (sexual desire), culture (parenting) and space (the city itself) in negotiating a pathway to a vice-free life:

“Rehabilitation seems increasingly difficult, owing to early wakening of sexual desire in young girls, even before they attain physical maturity, and owing to the extreme ignorance, poverty, and even wickedness of parents, who frequently, for economic reasons, do not hesitate to prostitute their girl children, to sell them into impossible marriages which eventually break down. The overcrowded conditions of Bombay City must make it appalling difficult for young girls to be brought up with any real sense of decency, and to be kept safe.”

Other organisations in India were less closely aligned to the state and cooperated more heavily with local institutions, leading to anti-vice spaces which took their inspiration from local ashrams as much as European rescue homes. Miss Mable Pillage replied to the League questionnaire on behalf of the AMSH’s Mysore State branch and the Missionary in Methodist Mission of Bangalore City. She claimed to have done ten years’ worth of moral hygiene work in Mysore State yet she had failed to secure financial support from the Princely State (despite appeals to government, municipal authorities, Directors of Industry and Education etc) and was thus dependent on voluntary subscriptions from individuals and institutions. In Bangalore City she was in touch with all the tolerated brothels and, with Indian helpers, would tell girls there of the Shanti Sadana Ashram run by the Methodist Mission. The home at the time held 35 girls and 20 babies. It was considered best to keep mother and child together, and the home would take care of the babies for a monthly fee if their mothers availed themselves of the provided opportunities for training in “…weaving, housecraft, mothercraft” or social work. The distinction offered here from the strict disciplinary models of other homes is stark. Pillidge stated that: “The life of the ashram is made as homely as
possible, so that those who would find it impossible to take their place again in society, may lead a useful life. This is not ideal, but sometimes necessary. ” Rehabilitation was said to be made difficult by the prevalent idea that a once-wronged girl was “fair sport”, so the ashram was made into a replication, and possibly engine, of home life (although the girl’s association with outcaste, or dalit/untouchable, work may have reinforced their social exclusion from orthodox communities):

“Girls are in families of four and five, one or two babies also in each home. They do their own shopping, arrange diet, cook, give necessary attention medically to family in sickness, and are responsible for the order of the home. Outdoor life has been much increased; games walks, etc. Life is made as normal as possible. Girls do social work in outcaste village near [sic]. Life is as full and interesting as possible, giving them every opportunity for improvement, so that they may be ready, if an opportunity arises, for placing again in Society.”

To place “fallen” women back into society was one of the chief aims of global anti-vice campaigners. By the early 1930s the League of Nations was moving beyond its previous definition of abolitionism (targeting the international means of trafficking) to a more aggressive target of abolishing the source of demand for prostitutes, which it identified as the brothel. In an attempt to assess how easy it was to find alternative ways of living after brothel closure, it issued a questionnaire to member states in 1935. It was suggested that each state interview 50 “prostitutes” (whether still active or “rescued”) and provide a range of biographical details. The Government of India passed on the request to its provinces, each of which sent a different reply depending on their interpretation of the questionnaire and their laws regarding prostitution.

Delhi’s Chief Commissioner insisted the province had no tolerated brothels (assuming toleration meant licensed, not “allowed” brothels) so provided no answers. Coorg insisted there were no prostitutes in that (small) province, while Assam said they did not have the relevant information, and the North-West Frontier Province said that collection of such information was impossible. The Punjab claimed they did not have enough time for such matters, but got Meliscent Shephard to pass on three illustrative case studies, while Bihar and Orissa submitted one sample case. The Burmese government insisted that it would not be worth collecting the information, as it seemed certain of the condition of prostitutes in Rangoon. All were said to be uneducated, apart from the Anglo-Indians, while pimps were said to have introduced most “girls” into the trade through deception. Three states, however, provided full answers with various levels of detail. The United Provinces (UP) provided 38 case studies. Eighteen cases were tabulated with minimal information, while a further twenty cases had brief life stories of women involved in prostitution. Bombay provided 50 detailed studies, which were printed by the government, with answers to all the League questions and an opening paragraph in the first person. For instance, the second case, a 28-year-old Muslim named
Husseini, opened with: “I am a native of Lahore. I was married to a Mohammedan at Lahore but after his death I came to Bombay about 12 years ago and started my life as a prostitute of my own accord.” The Bengal government also provided fifty ‘life histories’, providing much of the relevant information in short-paragraph descriptions in the third person. The diversity of responses reflects the lack of coordinated policy regarding prostitution in India, reflecting the devolution of these issues under the dyarchy reforms of 1919. The following analysis will read across the three provinces that gave detailed responses (UP, Bombay and Bengal).

The Bengal survey was carried out in Calcutta, and these life histories have been analysed, from the originals in the Bengal Archives, by historian Indrani Chatterjee. She highlights the significance of the histories, given the imperial emphasis on white prostitutes and the nationalist emphasis on countering orientalist stereotypes. The survey’s focus on the women themselves was relatively new, as was the League’s interest in the rehabilitation of prostitutes. Chatterjee’s use of the Bengal archives brings special benefits; she is able to detect how the replies had been edited and translated, and how the Government of Bengal had cut down on the “sob stuff.” But using the replies from the League archives in Geneva also allows comparison across provinces, and to compare the answers to the specific questions that were asked (a questionnaire was not preserved in the Bengal archives).

The questions were:

a) Name, age, and civil status  
b) Type of school attended  
c) Age on leaving school  
d) Character of employment first entered  
e) At what age did women leave home, what was the character of her background  
f) Age on first conviction and of subsequent convictions  
g) Any social service given [referring to any care received]  
h) Assessment of the mental conditions viz. certifiable, borderline, normal, superior.

Many of Chatterjee’s reservations about the Bengal replies apply to the collection as a whole: the nature of translation and the means of interview remain unclear; while the police may have gone to the “upper crust” which they were informally acquainted with. But the larger collection also has much to tell us, as Chatterjee shows, about the role of marriage in women who became prostitutes, the frequency of abduction and/or elopement, the position of mothers, pimps and the police, and the experiences of children. While a comparative approach to the statistical mass of cases will be adopted here, this risks further silencing the life-traces that the questionnaires preserve. As such, stand-out excerpts from the life histories suggest links to wider conclusions about agency, resistance, and the archive itself.
While Chatterjee’s summary analysis of the Bengal returns will be used for comparison below, there are certain calculations possible for the Bombay and UP returns that the Calcutta survey didn’t allow. While the Bengal replies included some greater detailing in life stories, there was no consistent data on age or religion. The provision of this data for UP and Bombay allows statistical comparison (see table 1). For instance, the Bombay women had a higher average age than the UP returns. This average was pulled up by older women, many of whom had been working for some time in Bombay and seemed to have established themselves in stable positions within the city’s sexual economy.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Province</th>
<th>Bombay</th>
<th>United Provinces</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Average Age</td>
<td>29.4</td>
<td>24.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lowest Age</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Highest Age</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anglo-Indian (%age)</td>
<td>1 (2.4%)</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Christian (%age)</td>
<td>6 (12.2%)</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Muslim (%age)</td>
<td>6 (12.2%)</td>
<td>14 (63.6%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hindu (%age)</td>
<td>36 (73.5%)</td>
<td>2 (9.1%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other (%age)</td>
<td>3 (6.1%)</td>
<td>6 (27.3%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1: age and background data for Bombay and the United Provinces

The categories feature many of the common confusions and overlappings of India’s complex religious and ethnic taxonomies. Anglo-Indians were usually Christian but were separately listed next to other religious categories, including Christianity, for Bombay. Likewise, three individuals were listed as Mahar, Murli and Marathi, which are regional and caste identities that could have been subsumed under their religion. The United Provinces covered many cities, but a recurring location was the Hindu holy city of Benares, which makes the high proportion of Muslim women surprising. However, the “other” replies included ten caste descriptors that form sub-categories of Hinduism (Rajput, Kahar, Kunbi, Brahman, Kurmi, and Ahir), as well as five regional “Bengali” descriptors with Hindu caste qualifiers (Brahmin, Kayasth, Kahar, Koeri, and Dusadh) taking the Hindu figure to 17 (43.6%) with various other regional and occupational entries (Bihari, Dhobi) also possibly being Hindu.

The Bengal replies suggested that marriage did not protect women from prostitution, Chatterjee’s first conclusion, and that analysis holds strong here. Just as 33 (66%) of the Bengal women had been married, so had 23 (46.9%) from the Bombay returns and 14 (35.9%) from the United Provinces. An outstanding feature across the statistics was the number of “child brides” (17 [34%] in Calcutta). In
1929 the “Sarda” (Child Marriage Restraint) Act had fixed the minimum age of marriage for girls at 14 and boys at 16 years. By this criteria or by women people didn’t specify an age of marriage but mentioned being married as a “child”, Bombay returned 21 respondents (42.9%) and the United Provinces six (15.4%) who had married under age or as a “child”. Of these, 17 (34.7% of total respondents) of the Bombay respondents were widows, and five (12.8%) in the United Provinces.

But widowhood (and the unlikelihood of remarriage) was not the only route for married girls/women into prostitution. Two married women were abducted and brought to Bombay for prostitution. A 25-year-old Hindu woman named Chandabai was a child bride who had been abducted aged 17 and brought to Bombay for domestic service, after which she was “induced” into brothel prostitution. A second 17-year-old woman named Sitabai had been married aged 10 and spent six years with her husband, before being “kidnapped” and deposited in a Kamathipura (the former tolerated “red light” district) brothel, before being rescued and taken to a children’s home.

However, many more were enticed away than kidnapped (10 from Bombay). The 20-year-old Benti, for instance, was from “Jammoo State” and had been married to a 50-year-old man when she was only eight. She complained of being ill-treated so a friend took her to Bombay where she was “made to live a life of shame”, though she was rescued to a children’s home. Various others told of being brought to Bombay and forced into prostitution, whether having been induced to leave by a professional procurer, or by exploiters who passed the girls on to pimps and brothels in Bombay.

Many of these cases overlapped with “seduction”; women who started affairs and agreed to leave their husbands, only to find themselves deserted and forced to resort to prostitution by families that had disowned them, or girls seduced and sold directly to prostitution. Others were deserted by their husbands, such as the 14-year-old girl Kashibai, who was married in Bombay aged nine but whose husband soon married again. While she was kept as a mistress for four years, after the husband died she resorted to prostitution.

While these narratives seem to describe an endless tale of exploitation and hopelessness, the women here detailed were anything but immobile, silent, and wholly subaltern. As the ‘seductions’ and ‘enticements’ above suggest, the women were very often accomplices in their movement from unhappy marriages with older men. Some women had also clearly established themselves as independent earners. Tarabai, for instance, was a 25 year old from Sholapur in southwest India. She claimed that she was too young to remember when her husband had died, but at 18 a prostitute neighbour introduced her into the trade and, seven years later, she was earning independently. Another, Shantibai, had been brought to Bombay and made to work for a pimp but, after his arrest, had continued to work independently. In many other cases it was explicitly clear that
the women had chosen this career themselves (though whether this was the insistence of the interviewer, the translator, or the interviewee is less clear). Ivy Hayes was a 31-year-old Anglo-Indian prostitute whose parents had died when she was 15 and who, having come to Bombay with her aunt a year later, had chosen to be a prostitute. Another 29-year-old woman, Jadibai, had been married at age 13 but had returned to her parents after four months because her husband mistreated her and had a mistress. When her parents died five years later she turned to prostitution. Similar experiences were reported from the United Provinces. A 30-year-old Bengali woman had been married aged 14 but her husband deserted her. She became a mistress for some time but left him to become a prostitute in Benares. A 22-year-old woman, listed only as a Muslim, had been married to someone much younger than her, who she left to enter prostitution. Another 36-year-old woman had been kidnapped by a woman servant who then deserted her. She found some work and eventually found a male partner, “...and on getting disgusted with him embraced prostitution.” Another woman, listed as a 20-year-old Brahmin from Calcutta, was disowned by her parents after forming “illegal connections” with a teacher while studying at school: “She mixed in the company of men freely and ultimately became a prostitute.”

These tales match the tenor of some of the more detailed life histories from Bengal, which were forwarded to Geneva as individually typed life stories. They provide incredibly rare insights into the lives of women classed as prostitutes, though the short descriptions are carefully selected and highly mediated. Despite this, the replies refuse to endorse any conflation of the subject position of the “prostitute” with a lack of agency of a situation of victimhood. For instance, one Amitabala Dutta was married aged 13 but did not get on well with her husband and had “illicit intercourse” with her cousin. They ran away together to his house in Calcutta: “She then grew tired of this man and went into a brothel. Here she managed to save a considerable sum of money and from her earnings paid the expenses of her sister’s education. She does not appear to wish to change her present mode of living.” Another woman, Ashalata Dassi aged 23, spoke of being tortured by her husband when she moved to his house a year after having been married to him aged seven. She was taken home by her mother and, after various spells of training and education, claimed that: “I started prostitution at the age of 12 years as the lives of prostitutes attracted me. I am quite happy with my present life.” Similarly, the 16 year old Biman-bala Dassi, whose mother was a retired prostitute, refused the marriage her mother arranged for her “... as I did not like to curtail my freedom by marriage... I spend my earning myself in my food and luxury. I am quite happy with my present life.”

The question of prostitution and childhood was also a vexed one, as displayed earlier in the different approaches to the children of prostitutes in rescue homes. Chatterjee showed that, contra popular
beliefs, only six (12%) of the Bengal woman had been the children of prostitutes, five of whom said their mothers had attempted to stop them entering the trade. The further files found in Geneva complicate this picture in various ways. The United Provinces returns came in two halves; one table of 18 cases, then shorter stories relating to 20 more women, the latter of which seem to have been from Benares and none of whom were born into prostitution. Fourteen of the first batch, however, were listed as having been “... brought up as a prostitute” and very little extra information was listed, other than that one had been to primary school. In the Bombay returns, seven (14.3%) were the daughters of prostitutes. Two were from Mangalore and did not mention religion or caste in their biographies. One, a 28-year-old called Sitabai, had followed her mother’s turn to prostitution after her father died when she was 17. A second, Appi, had left her mother to practice prostitution in her home while she came to Bombay to earn more money. The five others from Bombay, however, fitted in to the much-discussed phenomenon of “temple brides”, “dancing girls” or devadasis. All of them spoken of being “devoted to God”; the three that mentioned an age of devotion put it at either four to five, ten, or ten to twelve years old. The former was sent to a brothel when she reached puberty, another started earning money from prostitution when she was 14, while a third started when she was 21. She described her mother as a murli (dancing girl), while another two referred to themselves as of the naikin (dancing) class. The questionnaire responses contained at their heart, therefore, the nub of orientalist fantasies about Indian prostitution (the devadasi or dancing girl), which brings us back both to the fictions and scandals with which this chapter opened.

**Fictional facts and the anti-vice lives**

The dancing girl and the devadasi had previously functioned as the standard, caste- and tradition-based colonial explanation for Indian prostitution. Yet by the 1930s any suggestion of blaming Indian tradition for its social problems had been outlawed following the controversy over Katharine Mayo’s condemnation of India for the treatment of its women. As such the British had been sure to expunge any mention of devadasi’s from the League’s report into TWC in the East nor would they figure substantially in the League’s 1937 meeting in Bandoeng, Java, to discuss trafficking. Yet the ambiguous place of these figures in the questionnaire replies reminds us of the ever-present intersection of fact and fiction in the libidinal economies of interwar prostitution. This intersection was evident in texts that based themselves both in science and erotica. In terms of the former, Santosh Kumar Mukherji had supplemented his previous historical works on prostitution in India (1934) with a broader piece on *Indian Sex Life and Prostitution* in 1945. Blending historical analysis with early 20th century sexual sciences, he moved from analysis of ancient “Hindu sexologists” through to surveys of 100 women living in brothels in 1940s Calcutta. Causes of
prostitution were said to be inclination (6), starvation (62), seduction and abandonment (19), social abandonment (5) and ill treatment by their family (8). But these causes were situated within their broader urban context, especially the distorted male to female ratios resulting from migrant labour. League of Nations reports were referred to in charting the decline of European prostitutes as suppressionist legislation had spread through the provinces. Yet between the scientific ratios and League approved statistics emerged much older imaginaries. Describing Upper Chitpore Road in Calcutta, as detailed by Anderson 24 years earlier, Mukherjee described the prostitutes of the city after the 1923 SITA. No longer women of light, they stood in their best attire just inside their abodes, the poor light disguising the faces of the older women: “From the street the sound of the tinkling bells on the feet of some of dancing girl, the sound of the music and revelry may be heard and lure the victims into the clutches of these women.” Echoing, consciously or not, the traits of Anderson and especially of Mani, Mukherjee’s sexology blends into a broader discourse of prostitution of which vice and anti-vice, fact and fiction, literature and brothel.

This chapter has sought to overview the people of antivice: from the tortured body of Akootai; to the campaigner Anderson; to the place-bound fictive women of prostitution literature; to the massed lives and numerals of survey studies. The dispersed archives from which these materials were drawn remind us of the transnational nature of the risk, governance and surveillance of prostitutes, even if their lives remain resolutely local. The diversity of sites and perspectives, from the social sciences to the arts and humanities, force us to face and reconstitute, today, the multiscalar frames of historical anti-vice lives.


———. "Stimulation, Segregation and Scandal: Geographies of Prostitution Regulation in British India, between Registration (1888) and Suppression (1923)." *Modern Asian Studies* 46, no. 6 (2012): 1459-505.


---


2 For a thorough investigation of the archives and colonial sexuality see Anjali Arondekar, *For the Record: On Sexuality and the Colonial Archive in India* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2009).


5 For a clear reading of the increasingly trans-national, and sexual, politics of the late-colonial state see Mrinalini Sinha, *Specters of Mother India: the global restructuring of an Empire* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2006).

6 For details of the gradual, pre-war turn against the idea of the tolerate brothel area see Stephen Legg, “Stimulation, Segregation and Scandal: Geographies of Prostitution Regulation in British India, between Registration (1888) and Suppression (1923),” *Modern Asian Studies* 46, no. 6 (2012).

7 Ashwini Tambe, *Codes of Misconduct: Regulating Prostitution in Late Colonial Bombay* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press 2009). chapter four.

8 “Mal” here indicating a wound, from a cane or, in this case, a yard measure.

9 “Lunar caustic” referred to silver nitrate, a disinfectant.

10 National Archives of India (henceforth NA)/Home(Police)/1917/December/128-130A

11 “Scrawling” is a now obsolete term, which could refer to crawling, used in the 16th - 17th century to refer to wretches or snakes, *Oxford English Dictionary* 1911, online 2012.

12 To rouse, or heat, herself. *Oxford English Dictionary* 1897, online 2012.

13 For similar augments regarding the now totemic subaltern subject of sati see Lata Mani, *Contentious traditions: the debate on sati in colonial India* (Berkeley; London: University of California Press, 1998).


National Archives of India, New Delhi (henceforth NA)/Home(Police)/1917/128-130

NA/Home(Police)/1917/173-189A

Legg, *Prostitution and the ends of empire: scale, governmentalities and interwar India*: 140.


Kerr wrote of three categories: the seduced and abandoned; the social seductress; and the common prostitute. See Legg, “Stimulation, Segregation and Scandal: Geographies of Prostitution Regulation in British India, between Registration (1888) and Suppression (1923),” 1495-96. Anderson later passed all his papers on to the campaigner Meliscent Shephard, who wrote in 1929 of four categories of prostitute, again marked by their location: ground floor cheap brothels; second floor dancers and foreign prostitutes; open shop front elite prostitutes; and street, “hereditary” prostitutes. See Stephen Legg, “An intimate and imperial feminism: Meliscent Shephard and the regulation of prostitution in colonial India,” *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space* 28, no. 1 (2010): 75.

Butsi usually referred to a makeshift settlement, slum or “shanty town”.


For a brilliant exposition of the potential of multi-sensory geographies for historical study see Neil Pemberton, “‘Bloodhounds as Detectives’: Dogs, Slum Stench and Late-Victorian Murder Investigation,” *Cultural and Social History* 10, no. 1 (2013).

On these terms, their geographies and power relations see David Armstrong, “Public health spaces and the fabrication of identity ” *Sociology* 27, no. 3 (1993). For applications to planning in imperial Asia see Robert Peckham and David M Pomfret, eds., *Imperial Contagions: Medicine and Cultures of Planning in Asia, 1880-1949* (Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press, 2013).

For comparisons between the stigmatisation of prostitutes and that of low caste or opposing religious groups see Charu Gupta, *Sexuality, obscenity, community: women, Muslims, and the Hindu public in colonial India* (Delhi: Permanent Black, 2001).


Ibid., 12.


Ibid., 20, 21.


A one-horse closed carriage.

A four wheeled carriage.

An elegant, expensive carriage.

An (electric) fan.

Mani, *The pen pictures of the dancing girl*: 52.

Ibid., 53.


See Tambe, Codes of Misconduct: Regulating Prostitution in Late Colonial Bombay 79-81.

Anderson, Calcutta Vice: 8-10.


See Legg, "An international anomaly? Sovereignty, the League of Nations, and India's Princely Geographies."


All of the following information comes from the replies to the questionnaires, from LoN/R4688/11160


LoN/R4688/11160

Also see Mabel Pillidge, "The work of the AMSH in an Indian State," The Shield 5th series III, no. 3 (1934).

For the Delhi rescue home’s disciplinary constitution see Stephen Legg, Governing Prostitution in Colonial Delhi: from Cantonment Regulations to International Hygiene (1864-1939), Social History 34, no. 4 (2009): 465.

LoN/R4688/11160

The incredibly detailed reports have been little commented studied, though for brief comments on the Australian replies see R. Frances, Selling Sex: A Hidden History of Prostitution (Sydney: University of New South Wales Press, 2007). 224.

LoN/R4696/19097. All the following quotations and data come from this file.

See Legg, Prostitution and the ends of empire: scale, governmentalities and interwar India. chapter two


Ibid., 29.

See Sinha, Specters of Mother India: the global restructuring of an Empire


On the necessity of viewing the subaltern as sensual, and even erotic, subjects see Ratna Kapur, Erotic justice: law and the new politics of postcolonialism (London: Glasshouse Press, 2005).

LoN/R4696/19097.


See Sinha, Specters of Mother India: the global restructuring of an Empire


Ibid., 97.

Ibid., 107.

Ibid., 113.